## OPUS<sub>2</sub>

MBR Acres Limited & Others v Free the MBR Beagles & Others

Day 1

April 24, 2023

Opus 2 - Official Court Reporters

Phone: 020 4518 8448 Email: transcripts@opus2.com

Website: https://www.opus2.com

1	Monday, 24 April 2023	1	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Attached to that there's what's called
2	(10.30 am)	2	a "List of evidence" $$
3	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Yes, Ms Bolton.	3	MS BOLTON: Yes.
4	Housekeeping and other matters	4	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: which consists of various links,
5	MS BOLTON: My Lord, good morning. I appear on behalf of	5	some newspaper articles, some links to Facebook and
6	the claimants in this matter with Ms Pratt. Mr Curtin	6	a Dropbox link referred to, "Undercover footage".
7	is here in person. Ms Jaffray cannot be here until	7	Unless there's a good reason for $$ I understand that
8	Wednesday, my Lord, because she has sentencing in the	8	you $$ if you received this at a similar time to when
9	criminal courts at present so she has to obviously be	9	I did ——
10	there.	10	MS BOLTON: Yes.
11	My Lord, there are a number of $$	11	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: obviously you're going to need tim
12	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Which court is that, do you know?	12	to have a look at it. I don't think we need to spend
13	MS BOLTON: It's Peterborough Magistrates' today. We don't	13	time doing that today. I think it's more profitable for
14	know what the court is tomorrow, my Lord. We can't see	14	you to consider it with your team because Mr Curtin is
15	anything on the list for tomorrow, but it may be that	15	not scheduled to give his evidence until later in the
16	it's a different court.	16	trial . So the parameters of his evidence we don't need
17	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: It's not ideal to have somebody being	17	to decide today. It may be that, having reviewed the
18	sentenced by two different courts on two different days,	18	material, you will focus your objections on some parts
19	but I'm sure there's a good reason for it.	19	of it or you may say that, actually, it doesn't cause
20	MS BOLTON: All I know is $$ I think the only notification	20	any problems. But let's see where we go with that
21	from the witnesses was for one day, so whether that's a	21	first .
22	mistake, I don't know.	22	MS BOLTON: Well, my Lord, it's quite important because it
23	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: All right. It doesn't matter. Just so	23	raises a number of issues. At the moment Mr Curtin
24	that you know, I don't know whether you were copied in,	24	doesn't have any witness evidence, he can't give oral
25	but Ms Jaffray requested a link to enable her to	25	evidence, we don't have anything to cross—examine him on
	1		3
	•		Ü
1	participate on CVP, which has been provided to her.	1	and he is limited at present to asking witnesses
2	We've not had a response, but she's used CVP before, not	2	questions on their witness statements, not advancing
3	without some difficulties on occasions, but she's been	3	positive case.
4	provided with the link so I hope she'll be able to join	4	So it is quite important that that's dealt with
5	us as and when she can.	5	fairly soon in the proceedings because we don't know
6	MS BOLTON: My Lord, yes. It seems to me that that may	6	what witnesses we need to call at the moment, which is
7	cause some difficulties for her today. That's why	7	another issue, because your Lordship gave a direction
8	I flag it. It's, as I understand it, that she is in	8	for the date for notification of that and otherwise the
9	court today.	9	witness evidence was to stand in chief, and the first
10	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: No, I understand that.	10	we've heard from Mr Curtin is at 2.45 this morning, so
11	MS BOLTON: My Lord, there is also $$ obviously late	11	it's quite relevant to whether they should be called and
12	evidence has been filed by Mr Curtin today. I had noted	12	what he can ask them.
13	originally it was an amendment to the defence but he	13	We don't have $$ if this is a witness statement,
14	tells me it's a witness statement. My Lord, obviously	14	then it is incredibly late $$
15	we haven't had a witness statement from Mr Curtin before	15	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: I get that, but $$
16	and I have explained to him the application he needs to	16	MS BOLTON: $$ and it does seem that it's rather affecting
17	make and we've sent him by email the documents for	17	the running of this trial as to whether we call
18	litigants in person as to how to make that application,	18	witnesses.
19	but it seems to me that's probably got to be dealt with	19	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, as I think I made clear last week
20	first today. Depending on your Lordship's decision —	20	or the week before, it's very important that we don't
21	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Let me just be clear about what	21	derail this trial on technicalities . It would be best
22	I understand you're referring to. I've received this	22	all round, not least for your clients, to deal with
23	morning Mr Curtin's what's described as "Defence	23	matters on the merits, and because there is this
24	statement", which is a three—page document.	24	enormous case of persons unknown, I'm going to have to
25	MS BOLTON: Yes.	25	look largely at evidence. Now, the extent to which

7

21

7

2.1

22

2.3

2.4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

2.0

21

2.2

2.3

25

1	witnesses are cross-examined is a different and
2	a separate topic, but just approaching this from
3	a pragmatic response, which is $$ I've literally read
4	Mr Curtin's three—page document this morning. He is
5	largely indicating the extent to which he disputes $$
6	let's just deal with his own case about what is alleged
7	against him. It would of course have been better if
8	Mr Curtin had filed a witness statement formally
9	disputing those things, but it can't come as a surprise
10	to anybody in these proceedings that $\operatorname{Mr}\nolimits$ Curtin takes the
11	position that he $$ nothing in this has surprised me and
12	I doubt it's surprised you. Essentially Mr Curtin says
13	as he's said throughout, which is, "I don't dispute
14	demonstrating but I do dispute that I've been doing
15	anything unlawful", in summary, and so his initial part
16	of his witness statement $$ well, this document, his
17	defence statement, is essentially putting out or giving
18	that account.
19	Then there's the second aspect, the relevance of
20	which we could debate, which is, for example, he's

attached the decision of the court in Brescia from 2014. Now, you may very well have some submissions to make on the relevance of that but that's not going to detain us very long. I suspect.

25 MS BOLTON: My Lord, I make a number of points. First of

5

1 all, if it is a witness statement, it needs to at least contain a statement of truth if it's going to be 2 3 admitted.

MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Right.

 $\ensuremath{\mathsf{MS}}$  BOLTON: Secondly, it is on the first day of trial and your Lordship was very clear to Mr Curtin at the PTR that he had already missed the deadline, that there may already be an objection to something being filed now, and that he should do it within a week. He didn't do that. He filed it at 2.45 this morning and obtaining documents of that nature must have taken some time. They couldn't have come at 2.45 this morning, so this is very, very late in the day. It does mean time is needed with my team. There are questions I need to ask my team. There are Dropbox links which we haven't looked at yet, we don't know what's in them --MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: That's why I suggested what I did.

17 18 MS BOLTON: So we will need time for that first of all.

19 Secondly --

> MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, I don't think it need delay your opening. My primary position is that we're going to have to adopt a fairly pragmatic approach to this trial.

Unless you're asking me, on the basis of Mr Curtin's

2.4 alleged default, to grant some sort of default order

against him today, prevent him from giving evidence,

1 prevent him from asking any questions of any witnesses,

then it seems to me that -- if you're not asking for

3 that, then it's a question of how we manage the

4 material

MS BOLTON: I think the point is, my Lord, that the court 5 has to decide whether they're going to permit him to do 6

that because he hasn't complied with any of the

directions. He is obliged to make a relief from 8 9 sanctions application and the court can only allow him

10 to give oral evidence if relief is given.

11 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Yes, I understand all of that. By far

12 and away the most important consideration that bears

13 upon that issue is the extent to which the lateness of

14 his evidence causes your clients prejudice in a real

15 sense. If it does, then I will listen to that and

16 I will make a decision on an informed basis, when you

17 and your team have had time to digest it and to marshall 18 considered arguments on the basis of that.

MS BOLTON: My Lord, I'm grateful. 19

20 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: I really don't want to be a tribunal

that simply says, "You're in default, you're out of the

22 picture, that's the end of it", because it's not

23 ultimately likely to be productive of what would be

2.4 recognised as justice.

2.5 I recognise the importance of compliance with court

1 rules and I recognise that the authorities make clear

2 that those rules apply equally to litigants in person as

3 they do to represented parties, but I'm really anxious

what -- I think everybody here wants to avoid, at almost

all costs, anything that's likely to derail the trial. 5

6 MS BOLTON: My Lord, I agree. My Lord, I simply make the

point that you can't even hear summary judgment 8 applications until we know the outcome of that because,

9 obviously, that will have a bearing on whether we make

10 that application as to what is allowed in.

11 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Against Mr Curtin?

12 MS BOLTON: Yes.

MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Right. 13

 $\ensuremath{\mathsf{MS}}$  BOLTON: So, my Lord, it seems to me that today I can 14

15 deal with an opening --

16 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, you can deal with an opening.

17 I'm not going to say that you have in any way waived or 18

withdrawn what are, on their face, perfectly reasonable

19 complaints to make about Mr Curtin's failure to comply

2.0 with the court's orders --

21 MS BOLTON: My Lord.

2.2 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: -- but what I want to look at -- and

23 we'll come back to it at a convenient point when you've

2.4 got the time. Fortunately we've got two days in this

2.5 week where we're not going to be sitting, so you're

Opus 2 Official Court Reporters

1	going to get more time than would ordinarily be the case	1	serious it is ——
2	and that's serendipitous for that purpose. But I'm	2	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Understood.
3	perfectly prepared to listen to the submissions that you	3	MS BOLTON: $$ but it may be fairer on her in any event.
4	want to make on this, but I think the submissions	4	Also I will be, in my opening, referring to the case
5	overall $$ you'll be in a better position to make them	5	against her, so that seems to me to be the fairest way.
6	and I'll be in a better position to adjudicate upon them	6	I know that she's struggled with some of the documents
7	when we can actually focus on what you say is real	7	that are being sent to her electronically so it's
8	prejudice and what should be the court's response to	8	probably best that she does hear it.
9	Mr Curtin's non—compliance with the rules or orders.	9	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Yes.
LO	MS BOLTON: My Lord, I'm grateful for that indication.	10	$\operatorname{MS}$ BOLTON: It may also give $$ whatever the outcome of any
L1	My Lord, the other point I raise $$ and it's	11	application for certainly Mr Curtin, if I may just
L2	a matter for your Lordship $$ we're ready to open. I'm	12	highlight that it might be helpful to Mr Curtin if that
L3	conscious, though, that certainly this morning	13	becomes a numbered document with a statement of truth
L4	Ms Jaffray cannot take part and whether that's fair $$	14	because then we're not into any technical issues and
L5	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Are you sharing the transcripts with	15	it's purely the substance and the impact that we're
L6	them?	16	dealing with, because I appreciate they are matters that
L7	MS BOLTON: I'm not sure. (Pause)	17	Mr Curtin may not have appreciated. But if ultimately
L8	My Lord, Ms Pratt makes a very good point.	18	this statement goes in and he's to be cross-examined on
L9	Originally Tuesday and Wednesday were non-sitting days	19	it, it will certainly be very helpful if there are at
20	because they were the days that Ms Jaffray was not here,	20	least numbered paragraphs for everybody.
21	so I'm wondering if what we should be doing is rejigging	21	My Lord, the pre-trial review order, Mr Curtin was
22	the timetable so that she can hear our opening and in	22	in court, but we haven't been able to serve it on him so
23	effect this should be the non—sitting day. It's just	23	I do need your permission, my Lord, to give that to him
24	unfortunate that she didn't tell us until after close of	24	today in court. I would ask that we do that so he is
25	business on Friday.	25	just aware what he should have done by now because
	,		<b>3</b>

23

2.4

25

9

1 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: There's perfect sense in that 2 suggestion. My hesitation about it is that there seems 3 to be a bit of uncertainty as to when Ms Jaffray may be available to next attend. MS BOLTON: She has emailed us and confirmed that she is 6 available after the first two days this week, so she's 7 available from Wednesday. MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: From Wednesday? 8 9 MS BOLTON: Yes. She's made that clear, that she's 10 available from them. 11 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Is your preference to adjourn to 12 Wednesday? 13 MS BOLTON: My Lord, it is. I make a couple of points. That is a point of fairness on Ms Jaffray as well. 14 15 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Yes. 16 MS BOLTON: Secondly, there is potential that, depending on 17 her sentence, we may not proceed against her anyway. It 18 depends on what the court decides. It might become 19 irrelevant --MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: You'll be lucky if you find that out 2.0 immediately. What is she being charged with? 21 22 MS BOLTON: As I understand, it is for sentence, my Lord. 23 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Oh, it is for sentence. Right, okay.

24 MS BOLTON: So I'm not clear. I'm aware of some of the

charges but not all of them, so I'm not clear as to how

10

1 otherwise I'm going to be referring to something that, 2. whilst he heard you say what he needed to do, he doesn't 3 have a physical copy of. MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Mr Curtin, would it be helpful for you to have a copy of this, the pre-trial order? 5 6 MR CURTIN: Yes, please. MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Okay. Fine. Very well. (Handed) 7 8 Right. 9 MS BOLTON: My Lord, I'm in your hands. 10 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, I think it's a perfectly sensible 11 suggestion and it will also give you the benefit of --12 it will give you  $--\ {\rm I}$  imagine you've got 100 other 13 things to do as well, but you will be able to at least 14 consider with your team, having reflected on what 15 Mr Curtin has provided, whether it gives rise to any 16 particular prejudice that you want to bring to my 17 18 MS BOLTON: My Lord, also, if it's going to require any 19 further time, it allows us to look at the timetable and deal with it that way, so I'm grateful, yes. 2.0 21 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: All right.

11

basis ordinarily that everybody, each litigant, whether 12

Mr Curtin, you've heard what Ms Bolton has said.

She is making a complaint that what you've provided,

you've provided very late and the court operates on the

2.5

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

2.0

21

22

23

2.4

1

2

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

1

2

3

5

6

9

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

2.0

21

2.2

2.3

2.4

25

they're represented or unrepresented, must comply with the court's orders. You were already in default in providing your statement when I saw you at the pre-trial review. Providing it after what might be called the eleventh hour is possibly the latest that a litigant can leave it before providing the material.

Now, I want you to reflect upon a couple of things, please, because, depending on the approach that Ms Bolton takes, she's got every right to object to you having failed to comply with the orders because it threatens to disrupt the trial. So what you're going to need to consider are three particular things, please. The first is, in order for it to be a witness statement, it has to have what's called a "statement of truth" on the bottom of it. If you look up "statement of truth" on the internet and you follow any of the Government links, gov.uk, it will take you to the Civil Procedure Rules

What part is it, Ms Bolton? 19

2.0 MS BOLTON: It's 22, my Lord.

2.1 MR CURTIN: Is it similar to the handbook?

MS BOLTON: It's in the text of the PTR order. 22

MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Ah. Good. Excellent. So it's in the 2.3

2.4 text. Whereabouts in it, Ms Bolton?

25 MS BOLTON: We're just organising a copy, my Lord.

13

MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: You'll also see it at the bottom of every one of the claimant's witness statements. What it is is a form of wording which essentially says, "I confirm that the contents of my statement are true and that I'm aware that I might be prosecuted if I state anything I know to be untrue", words along that line. 7 MS BOLTON: Paragraph 10 of the PTR order. MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: If you look at paragraph 10 in the 8 order you've just been given, that will tell you what 10 must be stated in order for your document to be a witness statement.

> The other thing that Ms Bolton has pointed out -and it's a reasonable request, it's not a criticism of you. If you've not been involved in legal proceedings like these before, you wouldn't have been aware of the importance of it -- but you've set out narrative text in your document without paragraph numbers. It would be helpful if you could put paragraph numbers into it and then resend it with the paragraph numbers and with the statement of truth to Ms Bolton and her team.

That's not necessarily going to put an end to the objections that she's got but what she's going to do is consider what's in this document and consider whether it gives rise to any prejudice. That means puts her and her clients in difficulties which can't easily be

14

remedied, for example, if you were to have raised matters which she knows they could present evidence relating to which they weren't aware of prior to now because you've only sent this document in the last 24 hours.

So she's going to think about that. Ms Bolton has proposed -- and I think it's a sensible proposal but this is your trial as well so I want to hear what you have to say about this  $\,--\,$  which is that we were not going to sit two days this week because Ms Jaffray is in court elsewhere. We had thought that that was going to be Tuesday and Wednesday. It now appears she's in court today and tomorrow. So what Ms Bolton is proposing is that we don't sit today and tomorrow and that we sit on Wednesday. That will allow Ms Jaffray to be back. And the alternative would be that we go ahead today, but that's rather unsatisfactory because it's important that Ms Jaffray hears what Ms Bolton says in her opening speech insofar as it concerns her.

She could of course -- I could make a direction that she be provided with a transcript, but then that means she's going to have to spend time reading the transcript and it would be a lot easier if she were here listening to it as it's being given.

25 So what's your position on whether we should adjourn

15

1 today and come back on Wednesday to allow Ms Jaffray to 2. be here?

3 MR CURTIN: Okay. First, I'd like to address you on the timing.

MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Yes. 5

MR CURTIN: I'd ask you to believe what I say, that I've 6 7 gone beyond here. Some of my traits you've gathered 8 maybe can be a bit higgledy-piggledy, and I'm not 9 defending myself. If this happened ten years ago. 10 20 years ago, possibly a similar pattern would have 11 happened, but I can't put it any other way.

12 To be honest, some of this case has triggered it. 13 I've sort of had very much a dark night of the soul sort 14 of mental breakdown, a bit of one. I've had -- my dad 15 died, I've had a lot of hatred and trolling due to this 16 campaign ...

MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Okay, Mr Curtin. Take a moment. 17

18 MR CURTIN: (Inaudible - overspeaking) but I'm not today a 19 cheeky chappy. I don't want my wrists slapped. I would 2.0

like some sort of general understanding and an 21 acknowledgement that this is ridiculous. And that's why

2.2 I did stay up til -- and I was working til quarter to

23 3.00 last night because I realised it's -- and hopefully 2.4

I've managed to just get in with the deadline. 25 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, you've missed more than one

	1. W. M. C. d	4	
1 2	deadline, Mr Curtin.	1 2	about this is largely going to be guided by the extent
	MR CURTIN: I have.	3	of the level of opposition or what the nature of the
3	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Look, I appreciate the difficulties	3 4	application is from Ms Bolton's team about your
4 5	that conducting litigation on your own presents. It's	5	non—compliance with the order.  MR CURTIN: Yes.
	difficult in ordinary cases. This is not an ordinary	6	
6	case. I've tried to manage this case so that, so far as		MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: All right? So, so that you understand
7	possible, the case against you is clearly defined and it	7	what I need you to do over the next two days, assuming
8	enables you, so far as possible, to be shielded from the	8	that you don't object to us adjourning today and coming
9	more difficult aspects of this case, which are all to do	9	back on Wednesday, is —— one of the things that I need
10	with the persons unknown litigation. But — and what we	10	you to do is to put the statement of truth on this
11	will try and do is I will try and conduct the trial in	11	document and put paragraph numbers on it and send it to
12	a way that will ensure that you understand what is	12	Ms Bolton's solicitors and to the court; all right?
13	required of you and that you have a fair opportunity of	13	MR CURTIN: Okay.
14	presenting your case and resisting or arguing against	14	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Now, let's just go back to the point
15	the case being made against you.	15	about are you happy for the case to be adjourned today
16	Consistent with my role as a judge —— I can't be	16	and for us to come back on Wednesday. I may be using
17	your advocate. I can only be somebody who, in discharge	17	"happy" as not necessarily the perfect word, but are you
18	of my independent function, points out the things that	18	content that that's the best course?
19	you need to do or to suggest to you these are the things	19	MR CURTIN: I did feel like pinching myself we were actually
20	that — based on my knowledge of your case, what you	20	going to start this trial, so I've got some fear it's
21	need to, for example, be asking witnesses. That's one	21	a bit more long grass, a bit more long grass.
22	of my obligations under CPR3.1(a), I think. Anyway, we	22	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: No, no, it's perfectly understandable.
23	can all look at that.	23	You probably know better than I do what Ms Jaffray's
24	But the important thing is for you not to become	24	position is . But she's not here today for perfectly
25	overwhelmed. Set yourself tasks and, if you need time	25	understandable reasons, because she's required in
	17		19
1	to do things, you just need to ask me. If you don't	1	a court elsewhere. She's going to be free on Wednesday.
2	understand what's going on, you need to tell me. But	2	The fairest thing $$ and I'd do the same for you if the
3	your side of the bargain is, when the court requires you	3	tables were turned. If you were required to be in
4	to do something, you must do it.	4	a court somewhere else, I wouldn't start without you
5	Now, we're going to not deal with the question of	5	either or I certainly wouldn't want to start without you
6	what happens about your late witness statement today.	6	unless there was a very good reason why we had to start
7	We're going to come back to that after Ms Bolton and her	7	without you. And if we did start without you, I would
8	team have had a chance to consider what you've actually	8	want to make sure you had a transcript of what was said
9	said in this document.	9	in your absence.
10	MR CURTIN: Yes.	10	MR CURTIN: Yes, I obviously can't make any submissions on
11	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: She may have some objections still	11	behalf of Ms Jaffray.
12	about the fact that it's late. You can't do anything	12	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: No, no, of course not.
13	about that now. You need to correct the point about the	13	MR CURTIN: I've got good lines of communication with her.
14	statement of truth in the document and the paragraph	14	I'd be content to ask for the trial to go ahead today,
15	numbers, but those are small things.	15	but only on the basis that I'm a friend of hers, I could
16	MR CURTIN: Yes.	16	tell her exactly ——
17	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: In relation to its lateness and the	17	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: No, no, that's no substitute for her
18	fact you haven't complied with the court's orders,	18	being here. She is ultimately, like you, going to be
19	there's nothing you can do to fix that at the moment.	19	responsible for conducting her own defence and, in order
20	Ms Bolton is quite right that you need to make an	20	to do that fairly , she needs to be here to understand

21

22

23

24

25

and to hear what's said against her.

read the documents. I  $--\,$ 

MR CURTIN: Okay. Is there any chance of a -- I was going

to ask for an adjournment of an hour today for you to

 $\label{eq:mr_def} \mbox{MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: No, because (inaudible - overspeaking)}.$ 

21

22

23

24

25

application to me for relief from sanction, but I can

waive the requirement that you do it through an

application notice. In trial you can make various

application notice. What attitude I ultimately take

applications that would ordinarily have to be made by

1	It's not in your interests to deal with it today and, in	1	My case is simple, but it does get very complicated
2	fairness to Ms Bolton, she's not in a position to deal	2	with $$ I feel like I've got some part to play in the
3	with it today $$	3	persons unknown case and it would actually help the
4	MR CURTIN: Okay.	4	court.
5	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: $$ and you're not really in a position	5	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, I'd have to hear what Ms Bolton
6	to ask her to because you've dumped this on her and her	6	said about that, but the position is that the claim
7	team in the small hours of this morning, so she needs	7	against persons unknown has been well, we'll need to
8	time to think about what you've said. Happily, it's not	8	go through and check the service provisions, but
9	a very long document and I don't think it will take	9	assuming that the claim form has been served in
10	Ms Bolton long to $$ it certainly won't take her long to	10	accordance with the alternative service order, then the
11	read it . She may need to make some enquiries about the	11	law says that the persons unknown in the category as
12	things that you've said and there may be things that she	12	defined have been served and are therefore parties to
13	wants to tell me about, particular items of what she	13	these proceedings. In theory, a whole bus—load of
14	will say is prejudice potentially, and then she may take	14	people could turn up and say, "I'm a person unknown.
15	an attitude or may make a submission later this week,	15	I want to make submissions". The reality is, in cases
16	which is that your failure to serve that document on	16	like that, nobody does attend.
17	time is serious and it has serious consequences, which	17	MR CURTIN: No.
18	she will outline, and then she may ask me to exclude	18	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: And so the court is left with the
19	that evidence and then I'll have to decide it and I'll	19	position, which is unusual for civil litigation in this
20	hear what you say about that, I'll hear what she says	20	country —— which is usually based on an adversarial
21	about that. But she's not in a position to make that	21	system, where one side comes along and makes allegations
22	submission today and you're not really in a position, as	22	and the other side says, "I accept that, but I deny
23	I've said, being the person who is in default of the	23	that" and "You shouldn't have that remedy for these
24	court's orders, to ask her to do that.	24	reasons". All of that is absent from the persons
25	MR CURTIN: Yes. You made a point about you hoped my	25	unknown litigation process. It puts an enormous strain
	21		23
1	defence $$ you tried to make that so simple, and when	1	on the judge in the litigation because it's my job to
2	I go through the documents, I find my case $$ that's not	2	make sure $$ I don't have anybody helping me with
3	what's overwhelming. I find it remarkably simple. It's	3	raising points in answer to the claimants' case. It's
4	been very easy to go through the documents. It's been	4	all my job. And that puts a strain on judges, who are
5	kind of $idiot-proof$ . D11 sticks out.	5	not used to having to operate an adversarial system
6	The complication for me sort of dawned on the last	6	where one side isn't present. But there we are. Those
7	hearing, when it became clear that $\boldsymbol{I}$ was the sort of	7	are the challenges that ${\sf I}$ have to face.
8	last man standing, along with Lisa, there was just the	8	MR CURTIN: Now, this leaves me with some nervousness but
9	two of us, and I was hoping to tag on the tails of $$	9	I'd rather deal with it now than later on. My
10	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: No, I appreciate that.	10	default $$ it's a serious one, but it's happened now.
11	MR CURTIN: $$ the barristers and it was like, "Oh, no", and	11	I don't envisage $$ I know a bit about how my dark
12	that's when it began to crunch me and that's when the	12	nights of the soul work. I'm up and ready for action.
13	delay started . So $$	13	But this sounds really terrible and I'm not being
14	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Okay.	14	cheeky.
15	MR CURTIN: Can I make one point? Can you just tell me $$	15	For example, there's $$ but none of my defence $$
16	I do feel nervous when I talk in that I just feel like	16	none of my defence is complicated, I don't see. There's
17	I want to sit down, but I genuinely would like the	17	a witness that I have not been able to get hold of.
18	answer to this, that if I had accepted it all $$ it's	18	She's a veterinary surgeon and I don't know what she's
19	a hypothetical question $$ and Lisa Jaffray, that would	19	going to put in her statement, but she's someone who
20	leave this trial to go ahead only against persons	20	we've relied on in the past for statements to say that
21	unknown and there would be no one in this court that	21	the conditions inside MBR are $$ just to bring some

23

24

25

You know you talked about rabbits in the hat. I do

 $\mathsf{not} \ -- \ \mathsf{you} \ \mathsf{can} \ \mathsf{bang} \ \mathsf{me} \ \mathsf{now} \mathsf{,} \ \mathsf{which} \ \mathsf{you} \ \mathsf{could} \ \mathsf{do} \ \mathsf{anyway}.$ 

23

24

I found astounding. So would that be the case?

 $\label{eq:mr} \mbox{MR CURTIN: What about my role, which was the original one?}$ 

MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Hmm-hmm.

1	There's no $6$ -foot rabbit $$ $6$ -foot white rabbit coming	1	everybody to reach and express their opinions on the
2	out of any hat. My defence is simple. Can I be allowed	2	basis of rigorous scientific analysis and fair-minded
3	some very simple extra points to that witness statement	3	assessment and a search for evidence and conclusions
4	or are you telling me, "No, you've blown it and that is	4	drawn on it. The law doesn't require that.
5	your $$ you cannot bring anything else in apart from	5	All the law requires is that you protest honestly
6	what's there"? As long as it's not complicated, because	6	and you're entitled to express your concerns about it,
7	I was exhausted last night when I finally finished it,	7	even if they are entirely misplaced. The law doesn't
8	and I know that's $$	8	stop people from expressing wrong-headed opinions. That
9	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, Mr Curtin, you're going to get an	9	would be a bad step for the law to do that and it
10	opportunity to file the updated, with paragraph numbers.	10	doesn't. So you're not required to show that you're
11	I'm not encouraging you to add anything more to it	11	right in your protest belief about the activities of the
12	because that just makes the position worse because in	12	claimants. The law is on your side to that extent.
13	the sense that Ms Bolton is going to go away and think	13	What the law won't $$ parts company is a protest
14	about the document that you've sent her.	14	right doesn't give you the right to trespass on people's
15	MR CURTIN: Yes.	15	land. It doesn't give you the right to damage their
16	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: If you've got any further points that	16	property. It doesn't give you the right to obstruct
17	you think you want to raise by way of evidence, you need	17	their employees or intimidate their employees going to
18	to tell Ms Bolton and her team straightaway.	18	and from their workplace.
19	MR CURTIN: Yes.	19	MR CURTIN: Absolutely.
20	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: I'm not saying that she $$ and the more	20	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: That is, in a nutshell, what this case
21	complicated they are and the more unexpected they are,	21	is about. It's about the conflict between the
22	the greater the argument that you're likely to be met	22	protesters' rights to protest about what they regard $$
23	with, which is, "It's too late to be raising these	23	their deep—seat convictions about what is wrong, they
24	points", because if they're things that could have been	24	believe, about what's taking place at MBR Acres, but on
25	investigated but haven't been, you're almost $$ I'm not	25	the other side, the claimants' right, as a lawful
	25		27
1	making a decision, but I can tell you that you'll face	1	company, carrying out a lawful business, to go about
2	an uphill struggle to be permitted to advance a case	2	their business and not have their employees intimidated,
3	like that hassues it source on unfolymous to the		
_	like that because it causes an unfairness to the	3	obstructed and their property damaged and their property
4	claimants.	3 4	
			obstructed and their property damaged and their property
4	claimants.	4	obstructed and their property damaged and their property trespassed upon. It's as simple as that.
4 5	claimants. MR CURTIN: Yes.	4 5	obstructed and their property damaged and their property trespassed upon. It's as simple as that.  MR CURTIN: (Inaudible — overspeaking) to balance the
4 5 6	claimants.  MR CURTIN: Yes.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Now, I don't want you to spend time	4 5 6	obstructed and their property damaged and their property trespassed upon. It's as simple as that.  MR CURTIN: (Inaudible — overspeaking) to balance the statement of Wendy Jarrett. They are bringing Wendy
4 5 6 7	claimants.  MR CURTIN: Yes.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Now, I don't want you to spend time because I think ultimately it's not likely to be time	4 5 6 7	obstructed and their property damaged and their property trespassed upon. It's as simple as that.  MR CURTIN: (Inaudible — overspeaking) to balance the statement of Wendy Jarrett. They are bringing Wendy Jarrett. She appears to appear like an expert witness.
4 5 6 7 8 9	claimants.  MR CURTIN: Yes.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Now, I don't want you to spend time because I think ultimately it's not likely to be time that's going to profit you. It is highly unlikely that	4 5 6 7 8	obstructed and their property damaged and their property trespassed upon. It's as simple as that.  MR CURTIN: (Inaudible — overspeaking) to balance the statement of Wendy Jarrett. They are bringing Wendy Jarrett. She appears to appear like an expert witness.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, I haven't given permission for
4 5 6 7 8 9	claimants.  MR CURTIN: Yes.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Now, I don't want you to spend time because I think ultimately it's not likely to be time that's going to profit you. It is highly unlikely that any evidence from a veterinary practitioner about the	4 5 6 7 8 9	obstructed and their property damaged and their property trespassed upon. It's as simple as that.  MR CURTIN: (Inaudible — overspeaking) to balance the statement of Wendy Jarrett. They are bringing Wendy Jarrett. She appears to appear like an expert witness.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, I haven't given permission for any expert evidence and Ms Bolton will have to persuade
4 5 6 7 8 9	claimants.  MR CURTIN: Yes.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Now, I don't want you to spend time because I think ultimately it's not likely to be time that's going to profit you. It is highly unlikely that any evidence from a veterinary practitioner about the conditions inside MBR Acres is going to be relevant for	4 5 6 7 8 9	obstructed and their property damaged and their property trespassed upon. It's as simple as that.  MR CURTIN: (Inaudible — overspeaking) to balance the statement of Wendy Jarrett. They are bringing Wendy Jarrett. She appears to appear like an expert witness.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, I haven't given permission for any expert evidence and Ms Bolton will have to persuade me that that evidence is (a) admissible, and she'll have
4 5 6 7 8 9 10	claimants.  MR CURTIN: Yes.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Now, I don't want you to spend time because I think ultimately it's not likely to be time that's going to profit you. It is highly unlikely that any evidence from a veterinary practitioner about the conditions inside MBR Acres is going to be relevant for the litigation that I have to deal with.	4 5 6 7 8 9 10	obstructed and their property damaged and their property trespassed upon. It's as simple as that.  MR CURTIN: (Inaudible — overspeaking) to balance the statement of Wendy Jarrett. They are bringing Wendy Jarrett. She appears to appear like an expert witness.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, I haven't given permission for any expert evidence and Ms Bolton will have to persuade me that that evidence is (a) admissible, and she'll have heard what I've said. Just as it's irrelevant for you
4 5 6 7 8 9 110 111 112	claimants.  MR CURTIN: Yes.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Now, I don't want you to spend time because I think ultimately it's not likely to be time that's going to profit you. It is highly unlikely that any evidence from a veterinary practitioner about the conditions inside MBR Acres is going to be relevant for the litigation that I have to deal with.  MR CURTIN: I expect in some —— I would have —— I know	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	obstructed and their property damaged and their property trespassed upon. It's as simple as that.  MR CURTIN: (Inaudible — overspeaking) to balance the statement of Wendy Jarrett. They are bringing Wendy Jarrett. She appears to appear like an expert witness.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, I haven't given permission for any expert evidence and Ms Bolton will have to persuade me that that evidence is (a) admissible, and she'll have heard what I've said. Just as it's irrelevant for you to prove that your opinions are right, it's just as
4 5 6 7 8 9 110 111 112 113	claimants.  MR CURTIN: Yes.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Now, I don't want you to spend time because I think ultimately it's not likely to be time that's going to profit you. It is highly unlikely that any evidence from a veterinary practitioner about the conditions inside MBR Acres is going to be relevant for the litigation that I have to deal with.  MR CURTIN: I expect in some —— I would have —— I know you're going to stop —— it's not going to be MBR's	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	obstructed and their property damaged and their property trespassed upon. It's as simple as that.  MR CURTIN: (Inaudible — overspeaking) to balance the statement of Wendy Jarrett. They are bringing Wendy Jarrett. She appears to appear like an expert witness.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, I haven't given permission for any expert evidence and Ms Bolton will have to persuade me that that evidence is (a) admissible, and she'll have heard what I've said. Just as it's irrelevant for you to prove that your opinions are right, it's just as irrelevant for the claimants to seek to prove that your
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 11 12 13 14	claimants.  MR CURTIN: Yes.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Now, I don't want you to spend time because I think ultimately it's not likely to be time that's going to profit you. It is highly unlikely that any evidence from a veterinary practitioner about the conditions inside MBR Acres is going to be relevant for the litigation that I have to deal with.  MR CURTIN: I expect in some —— I would have —— I know you're going to stop —— it's not going to be MBR's vivisection on trial. I'm expecting that. But that's	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	obstructed and their property damaged and their property trespassed upon. It's as simple as that.  MR CURTIN: (Inaudible — overspeaking) to balance the statement of Wendy Jarrett. They are bringing Wendy Jarrett. She appears to appear like an expert witness.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, I haven't given permission for any expert evidence and Ms Bolton will have to persuade me that that evidence is (a) admissible, and she'll have heard what I've said. Just as it's irrelevant for you to prove that your opinions are right, it's just as irrelevant for the claimants to seek to prove that your opinions are wrong. The court is not going to
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 111 112 113 114 115	claimants.  MR CURTIN: Yes.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Now, I don't want you to spend time because I think ultimately it's not likely to be time that's going to profit you. It is highly unlikely that any evidence from a veterinary practitioner about the conditions inside MBR Acres is going to be relevant for the litigation that I have to deal with.  MR CURTIN: I expect in some —— I would have —— I know you're going to stop —— it's not going to be MBR's vivisection on trial. I'm expecting that. But that's why I brought in the —— my friend of mine in that	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	obstructed and their property damaged and their property trespassed upon. It's as simple as that.  MR CURTIN: (Inaudible — overspeaking) to balance the statement of Wendy Jarrett. They are bringing Wendy Jarrett. She appears to appear like an expert witness.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, I haven't given permission for any expert evidence and Ms Bolton will have to persuade me that that evidence is (a) admissible, and she'll have heard what I've said. Just as it's irrelevant for you to prove that your opinions are right, it's just as irrelevant for the claimants to seek to prove that your opinions are wrong. The court is not going to adjudicate on either of those issues.
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 111 112 113 114 115 116 117	claimants.  MR CURTIN: Yes.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Now, I don't want you to spend time because I think ultimately it's not likely to be time that's going to profit you. It is highly unlikely that any evidence from a veterinary practitioner about the conditions inside MBR Acres is going to be relevant for the litigation that I have to deal with.  MR CURTIN: I expect in some — I would have —— I know you're going to stop —— it's not going to be MBR's vivisection on trial. I'm expecting that. But that's why I brought in the —— my friend of mine in that I am —— I can't —— I've used it in that, I am disgusted,	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	obstructed and their property damaged and their property trespassed upon. It's as simple as that.  MR CURTIN: (Inaudible — overspeaking) to balance the statement of Wendy Jarrett. They are bringing Wendy Jarrett. She appears to appear like an expert witness.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, I haven't given permission for any expert evidence and Ms Bolton will have to persuade me that that evidence is (a) admissible, and she'll have heard what I've said. Just as it's irrelevant for you to prove that your opinions are right, it's just as irrelevant for the claimants to seek to prove that your opinions are wrong. The court is not going to adjudicate on either of those issues.  MR CURTIN: Okay. They're not?
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	claimants.  MR CURTIN: Yes.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Now, I don't want you to spend time because I think ultimately it's not likely to be time that's going to profit you. It is highly unlikely that any evidence from a veterinary practitioner about the conditions inside MBR Acres is going to be relevant for the litigation that I have to deal with.  MR CURTIN: I expect in some — I would have —— I know you're going to stop —— it's not going to be MBR's vivisection on trial. I'm expecting that. But that's why I brought in the —— my friend of mine in that I am —— I can't —— I've used it in that, I am disgusted, and my disgust about how MBR treats dogs is a common	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	obstructed and their property damaged and their property trespassed upon. It's as simple as that.  MR CURTIN: (Inaudible — overspeaking) to balance the statement of Wendy Jarrett. They are bringing Wendy Jarrett. She appears to appear like an expert witness.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, I haven't given permission for any expert evidence and Ms Bolton will have to persuade me that that evidence is (a) admissible, and she'll have heard what I've said. Just as it's irrelevant for you to prove that your opinions are right, it's just as irrelevant for the claimants to seek to prove that your opinions are wrong. The court is not going to adjudicate on either of those issues.  MR CURTIN: Okay. They're not?  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: No.
4 5 6 7 8 9 110 111 112 113 114 115 116 117 118	claimants.  MR CURTIN: Yes.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Now, I don't want you to spend time because I think ultimately it's not likely to be time that's going to profit you. It is highly unlikely that any evidence from a veterinary practitioner about the conditions inside MBR Acres is going to be relevant for the litigation that I have to deal with.  MR CURTIN: I expect in some —— I would have —— I know you're going to stop —— it's not going to be MBR's vivisection on trial. I'm expecting that. But that's why I brought in the —— my friend of mine in that I am —— I can't —— I've used it in that, I am disgusted, and my disgust about how MBR treats dogs is a common point of view.	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	obstructed and their property damaged and their property trespassed upon. It's as simple as that.  MR CURTIN: (Inaudible — overspeaking) to balance the statement of Wendy Jarrett. They are bringing Wendy Jarrett. She appears to appear like an expert witness.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, I haven't given permission for any expert evidence and Ms Bolton will have to persuade me that that evidence is (a) admissible, and she'll have heard what I've said. Just as it's irrelevant for you to prove that your opinions are right, it's just as irrelevant for the claimants to seek to prove that your opinions are wrong. The court is not going to adjudicate on either of those issues.  MR CURTIN: Okay. They're not?  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: No.  MR CURTIN: So when we deal with Wendy Jarrett ——
4 5 6 7 8 9 110 111 112 113 114 115 116 117 118 119 20	claimants.  MR CURTIN: Yes.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Now, I don't want you to spend time because I think ultimately it's not likely to be time that's going to profit you. It is highly unlikely that any evidence from a veterinary practitioner about the conditions inside MBR Acres is going to be relevant for the litigation that I have to deal with.  MR CURTIN: I expect in some —— I would have —— I know you're going to stop —— it's not going to be MBR's vivisection on trial. I'm expecting that. But that's why I brought in the —— my friend of mine in that I am —— I can't —— I've used it in that, I am disgusted, and my disgust about how MBR treats dogs is a common point of view.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Yes, but the law works in your favour	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	obstructed and their property damaged and their property trespassed upon. It's as simple as that.  MR CURTIN: (Inaudible — overspeaking) to balance the statement of Wendy Jarrett. They are bringing Wendy Jarrett. She appears to appear like an expert witness.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, I haven't given permission for any expert evidence and Ms Bolton will have to persuade me that that evidence is (a) admissible, and she'll have heard what I've said. Just as it's irrelevant for you to prove that your opinions are right, it's just as irrelevant for the claimants to seek to prove that your opinions are wrong. The court is not going to adjudicate on either of those issues.  MR CURTIN: Okay. They're not?  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: No.  MR CURTIN: So when we deal with Wendy Jarrett — MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: I don't — you can take it, Mr Curtin
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	claimants.  MR CURTIN: Yes.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Now, I don't want you to spend time because I think ultimately it's not likely to be time that's going to profit you. It is highly unlikely that any evidence from a veterinary practitioner about the conditions inside MBR Acres is going to be relevant for the litigation that I have to deal with.  MR CURTIN: I expect in some —— I would have —— I know you're going to stop —— it's not going to be MBR's vivisection on trial. I'm expecting that. But that's why I brought in the —— my friend of mine in that I am —— I can't —— I've used it in that, I am disgusted, and my disgust about how MBR treats dogs is a common point of view.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Yes, but the law works in your favour in this respect in this case because the law of protest	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	obstructed and their property damaged and their property trespassed upon. It's as simple as that.  MR CURTIN: (Inaudible — overspeaking) to balance the statement of Wendy Jarrett. They are bringing Wendy Jarrett. She appears to appear like an expert witness.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, I haven't given permission for any expert evidence and Ms Bolton will have to persuade me that that evidence is (a) admissible, and she'll have heard what I've said. Just as it's irrelevant for you to prove that your opinions are right, it's just as irrelevant for the claimants to seek to prove that your opinions are wrong. The court is not going to adjudicate on either of those issues.  MR CURTIN: Okay. They're not?  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: No.  MR CURTIN: So when we deal with Wendy Jarrett — MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: I don't — you can take it, Mr Curtin that you're objecting to Ms Jarrett's evidence. As I've
4 5 6 7 8	claimants.  MR CURTIN: Yes.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Now, I don't want you to spend time because I think ultimately it's not likely to be time that's going to profit you. It is highly unlikely that any evidence from a veterinary practitioner about the conditions inside MBR Acres is going to be relevant for the litigation that I have to deal with.  MR CURTIN: I expect in some — I would have —— I know you're going to stop —— it's not going to be MBR's vivisection on trial. I'm expecting that. But that's why I brought in the —— my friend of mine in that I am —— I can't —— I've used it in that, I am disgusted, and my disgust about how MBR treats dogs is a common point of view.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Yes, but the law works in your favour in this respect in this case because the law of protest and the Article 10 right that underpins protest doesn't	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	obstructed and their property damaged and their property trespassed upon. It's as simple as that.  MR CURTIN: (Inaudible — overspeaking) to balance the statement of Wendy Jarrett. They are bringing Wendy Jarrett. She appears to appear like an expert witness.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, I haven't given permission for any expert evidence and Ms Bolton will have to persuade me that that evidence is (a) admissible, and she'll have heard what I've said. Just as it's irrelevant for you to prove that your opinions are right, it's just as irrelevant for the claimants to seek to prove that your opinions are wrong. The court is not going to adjudicate on either of those issues.  MR CURTIN: Okay. They're not?  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: No.  MR CURTIN: So when we deal with Wendy Jarrett — MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: I don't — you can take it, Mr Curtin, that you're objecting to Ms Jarrett's evidence. As I've said, Ms Bolton does not have permission for that

25

I apologise to everyone, but in this case -- my sister

25

of expression would be weakened if the law required

2

3

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

2.0

21

2.2

23

2.4

25

1	explained to me the other day, take ten seconds. I've	1	clair
2	got some bad habits and it's like they're all $$ they're	2	as a
3	rolled into one.	3	
4	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, Mr Curtin, one relevant	4	witn
5	consideration that I have to consider at any question of	5	Mr I
6	relief $\ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \$	6	evid
7	it were, giving you permission to rely upon your witness	7	the
8	statement notwithstanding that it's come late $$ one of	8	if t
9	the factors the court takes into account and must	9	calle
10	consider is the reason why there has been a default.	10	So I
11	Now, you've told me a little bit about that today but if	11	vide
12	you want to tell me more about that, you might need to	12	MR JUS
13	write it down in a separate witness statement to explain	13	I do
14	what difficulties you've been under and why it is you	14	with
15	didn't comply with the court's deadline.	15	as i
16	MR CURTIN: Okay.	16	1' 11
17	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: All right? Give some thought to that	17	that
18	because it is an important consideration, and if you	18	poin
19	want to rely upon your own difficulties $$ you mentioned	19	nece
20	your father's death, for example $$ or that you've	20	all
21	struggled with preparing for this case, then just	21	ther
22	explain that to me. All right?	22	it s
23	MR CURTIN: Thank you.	23	
24	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Right. Ms Bolton, is that about as far	24	have
25	as we can take it today, is it?	25	expe

29

MS BOLTON: My Lord, it is. If I may just pick up on a couple of things because it may be of assistance to Mr Curtin. He said if he had taken a deal. First of all  $\,--\,$  because I think your Lordship has indicated to Mr Curtin that this isn't a trial about people's beliefs and indeed it's not, and my concern is that some of what is wanted to be asked to witnesses is actually to do with those beliefs and I'm not sure that Mr Curtin appreciates that won't be relevant points to put to the witnesses or that they would be -- that the court is likely to find them obliged to answer. What I wouldn't want him to do is to put himself through a trial where he would otherwise have accepted a deal because he didn't appreciate that this is not the time for those political statements and those beliefs. That's not what happens at trial.

So I simply in court make that clear to Mr Curtin because, obviously, the claimant is -- I looked at his defence. His defence did indicate he was prepared to accept the injunction that the court ordered, but, unfortunately, we've had no further progress with him. So he should be clear that if he is struggling and that was his intention, to put questions of that nature to the witnesses, that he may still want to think about whether he takes the claimants' offer because the

30

claimant hasn't withdrawn its offer. So I just make that as a point of assistance.

My Lord, the other thing is whilst the position with witnesses and evidence is up in the air, may I ask that Mr Hardy, Mr Jacklin and Mr Markou also give their evidence by videolink because, one, they are needed at the claimants' premises and, two, we simply don't know if they're going to be called, when they're going to be called, whether there's any relevant questions for them. So I would ask — the others are giving evidence by videolink —

IR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Yes, I'm largely happy with that, but I don't have Ms Jaffray here. There are disadvantages with videolinks and I'm not saying that I'm giving my —— as it were, I'm making a ruling now that they can. What I'll say so that everybody hears, Mr Curtin as well, is that I'm broadly sympathetic to that. Certainly from my point of view, I'm happy with that as long as the necessary arrangements are made at the remote end that all of the relevant documents are there and somebody is there to monitor and ensure that everything operates as it should.

My only reservation is the litigants are going to have to deal partly in this case with -- on a day-to-day experience and their ability to marshall their arguments

31

at a point that's divorced from the event may be not as good as legally trained people.

3 MS BOLTON: Yes.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: So I will give them the opportunity to make any submissions they want to about requiring the witnesses' attendance, but I am absolutely clear that I don't want them to be inconvenienced to the extent that they're having to come down to court to be on standby. That's not an option. Even if I were to be persuaded that one or other of them ought to be required to attend, we will make the necessary arrangements in the timetable for that person to come. But that will be after I've heard submissions and, as it were, I've been persuaded that my preliminary view, which is it's acceptable for them to give their evidence by videolink, is, for whatever reason, I'm persuaded by one or other of the defendants that I should take the course of requiring the witness to attend.

 $\begin{array}{ll} \text{19} & \text{MS BOLTON: My Lord, the witnesses I'm talking about are} \\ \text{20} & \text{those that are not primarily covered by that order, so} \\ \text{21} & \text{the anonymity } -- \end{array}$ 

MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: No, I know that. You're talking about
 routine videolink evidence, which is the one that we're
 all familiar with.

25 MS BOLTON: Yes. I believe Ms Pressick will still be

2	be seeking to rely upon Ms Jarrett for impact, not for
3	expertise. I just make that very clear.
4	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Right. Well, you've heard what I've
5	said. I'll need some persuading. Anything she wants to
6	opine about research on animals is irrelevant . She can
7	talk about the impact on her of $$ does she go to and
8	from?
9	MS BOLTON: No, my Lord, the impact in respect of if the
10	claimant had closed, that's $$
11	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Why is that relevant?
12	MS BOLTON: Well, it's relevant, my Lord, because it's
13	relevant to your discretion on granting an injunction.
14	The impact is going to be relevant to these proceedings.
15	That's the limit. I'm certainly not looking to get into
16	a debate over what is or what isn't permitted to be
17	tested without first $$ proceed to clinical trials
18	without being tested on animals.
19	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Let's just test that submission
20	because, if it were right and you could bring evidence
21	and say, "We're entitled to bring this evidence about
22	what the consequence would be if this facility closed
23	down", I think that's right $$ even if it were relevant
24	to my discretion, I think it would be right at the
25	periphery of it.

attending, my Lord. Regarding Ms Jarrett, I will only

33

But if it's admissible, relevant evidence on that

2 question of discretion, then it would have to be 3 admissible and relevant for the defendants. So if they wanted to call a battery of experts who wanted to come 5 along and say, "In fact, animal testing is moving along 6 and it's only a matter of time before the legislation 7 will change and so actually the impact of this protest 8 carrying out or the scope of an injunction the court may 9 grant wouldn't have the effect that Ms Jarrett is 10 suggesting at all", I just -- I regard that as so far 11 away from the issues I have to decide as to open up an 12 issue that I don't -- I mean, purely on case management 13 grounds I would be inclined to be reluctant to go into 14 it because it's a one-sided argument about the merits of 15 animal testing and that's not what the court is 16 adjudicating upon. 17 MS BOLTON: Well, my Lord, I make the point it did feature 18 in people's defences, that they were going to bring that 19 evidence and they could have brought that evidence and 2.0 they haven't, so in all fairness to the claimants, it 21 would be probably unwise of them not to have provided 2.2 the evidence they have. But my position is that, as 2.3 things stand at present, the only thing it can be 2.4 relevant to is impact if the premises were to close. 25 I make that clear. But that's why Ms Jarrett's evidence

is in, because that was the position taken in some of 2 the defences, that they would be adducing that evidence. 3 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Right. Okay. Well, we'll look it up. But I'm not ... 4 MS BOLTON: Mr Curtin, do you want to say something? 5 MR CURTIN: You are able to do your job. I just ask for 6 7 some sort of -- can I call it common sense, that we're 8 not dealing with a potato factory. It is a place of 9 high emotion. The reason I get passionate and very, 10 very angry there sometimes for things like, you know, at 11 the weekend, the dogs are left from 11.00 am to 7.00 am 12 the next morning. 13 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Okay, Mr Curtin, I don't want to --MR CURTIN: So I would want to ask the workers --14 15 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: I don't think your honesty of belief is 16 going to be challenged in these proceedings. I don't 17 think the sincerity with which you hold your opposition 18 to what happens at MBR Acres will be challenged. You 19 won't need to prove it. 20 MR CURTIN: But I would want the workers to -- I would want 2.1 to guide the workers, "Do you understand the level of --22 have you any  $\dots$ " -- because their statements are, 23 "Everything's fine. It's a totally non-dog breeding 2.4 centre, with (inaudible)". So when they're talking 25 about being frightened of being shouted at, have they

35

got any understanding of how controversial the place 2 they're working in is? 3 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, Mr Curtin, I think you need to understand that the parameters of this litigation are not going to dwell, even if they're permitted at all, on 5 6 the question as to whether the employees that work for 7 MBR Acres understand these things, whether they ought to 8 think about whether they ought to be working there. 9 It's not part of your case or your defence —— it's not 10 a defence for you to try and persuade any of the 11 employees about whether they ought to reflect on their 12 employment choices. That's not the purpose of asking 13 these witnesses questions. MR CURTIN: Yes, but --14 15 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: They are entitled to go to and from 16 their workplace, the law says, without being subject to 17 obstruction or intimidation or harassment. 18 MR CURTIN: Yes, I understand that. 19 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: That really is the point. So it 2.0 doesn't matter what -- largely, for the purpose of the 21 civil litigation, and so that I'm not misunderstood, I'm 2.2 not saying that it's not important in the wider context, 23 but in this litigation , what takes place at MBR Acres is 2.4 relevant only because it is what is the source of or

gives rise to the sincerely held protest beliefs of

34 36

25

1	those who have attended and protested over the years.	1	assuming that they prove that to be right, assuming that
2	But that's the limit of it . Just as much as you aren't	2	they persuade me that, on the balance of probabilities,
3	required $$ the court is not going to require you to	3	on the evidence that's produced in the trial and taking
4	demonstrate your bona fides in your protest belief, it	4	into account your evidence as well, whether I conclude
5	is just as much irrelevant to enquire as to whether or	5	that you have in fact on one or more occasions
6	not the employees are concerned about the job they do.	6	obstructed vehicles, obstructed access to the land,
7	That's not relevant.	7	trespassed on the land, $ I $ will then make the findings as
8	MR CURTIN: Okay. One more. A hypothetical example, then.	8	to how many times that took place and then I'll consider
9	It would be my case to the security guard, say	9	if $\ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \$
10	Mr Manning, the boss of security $$ he knows who comes	10	the past and you should be restrained from doing it in
11	in at those gates. It's his job. What happens at	11	the future.
12	4 o'clock, when the workers leave? "I suppose you know,	12	So the second part of the trial process that we will
13	security guard, is there a worker on site who is able to	13	go through is Ms Bolton's arguments, assuming that she's
14	deal with an emergency?". It's a puppy factory.	14	right in demonstrating that you've been guilty of some
15	Puppies are being bred all the time. Is there anyone on	15	civil wrong in the past, whether you should be the
16	site $$ or is it $$ it's my case that it's just	16	subject of an injunction going forward. Those are the
17	security , so not to go into any $$ so that type of $$	17	two fundamental aspects of the trial.
18	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: I can't see what the relevance of that	18	MR CURTIN: Yes.
19	question would be.	19	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: You'll notice in that that none of tha
20	MR CURTIN: It would go to the reason why there's people	20	investigates what's going on at MBR Acres and it doesn't
21	going outside, going $\dots$ because $$	21	involve investigating what people are doing at
22	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: But you don't have to prove that you're	22	Camp Beagle. It only concerns individual defendants and
23	right . That's not what protesters require $$ the law	23	what the allegations and the evidence is as to what they
24	doesn't require protesters to prove that they are right.	24	are alleged to have done. That's it.
25	In some areas that attract the most serious conflict	25	MR CURTIN: But Wendy Jarrett's statement and
	37		39
1	between people's beliefs, it would be impossible to	1	Susan Pressick's $$ especially Wendy Jarrett's is
2	prove who is right because it's about what you believe.	2	absolutely full of La La Land comments about the
3	MR CURTIN: But would that be a harmful question or answer	3	situation; "There's absolutely nothing wrong.
4	to ask Mr Manning? At 4 o'clock, or on a Saturday at	4	Everything is fine. It's perfectly regulated".
5	11 o'clock, when the workers appear to leave, "Are there	5	I understand $$ it's never been my point that $$
6	just security guards on site?". I can't see the harm of	6	unfortunately it's legal for this company to leave the
7	that type of question. That's not an exploration into	7	dogs from 11.00 am to 7.00 am because it's the
8	the	8	Home Office. No one else in the world could do it.
9	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Okay. It's just not relevant,	9	I won't be contesting that $$ I would have put it down
10	Mr Curtin. The important thing for you to understand is	10	by now $$ categorical breaking the law, no. Let's see
11	that the court is not carrying out a public inquiry	11	how we get on.

12 MR CURTIN: I understand that.
 13 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: -- into MBR Acres, just as much as it's

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

not carrying out a public inquiry into the protesters.

The limits of the litigation are really quite simple, which is, in your case, a series of allegations have

been made against you about your protest activities and it being alleged that on occasions you have been guilty of obstructing access or vehicles and that you have trespassed on land. Those are the allegations that are made against you. They're set out in the particulars of claim that are relevant to you.

What the court is going to be adjudicating upon is, one, whether the claimants have demonstrated, by their evidence, that you did that and then, number two,

38

then I'll listen to what you say about it and then I'll make a decision. But at the moment I have difficulty in

But that's the sort of question that I was thinking

of asking Mr Manning; "You, as a security guard, do you know who comes in?". I've been there 20 months.

There's been one overnight vet call which he would be

MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Okay. Mr Curtin, I've made clear that

about it more because I'm not making a decision today --

if you want to think about it and advance an argument as

I don't think that's relevant. If you want to think

to why it's relevant to the issues I have to decide,

able to help the court, and that's remarkable.

seeing what the relevance of that evidence would be,

and, therefore, because it's my job to control the

40

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

2.0

evidence and the questions of witnesses strictly to that	1	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: And you're able to persuade me, then
which is relevant to the issues the court has to decide,	2	fine .
if you were to ask those questions, almost certainly	3	MR CURTIN: (Inaudible $-$ overspeaking) case, where I've
Ms Bolton will object and, if I don't think that you've	4	stumbled, and this is a catastrophe, what I've done this
demonstrated that the evidence or the answer to the	5	time is with the written word. I've come to every
question is going to be relevant to the issues I have to	6	single hearing and I'm engaged in this case and I will
decide, then I will tell you that you can't ask the	7	continue to be.
question.	8	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: All right. Okay.
MR CURTIN: Okay. Well, on one hand I would ask you now to	9	Anything more we need to deal with today?
strike out Wendy Jarrett's statement because of its	10	MS BOLTON: My Lord, no.
flowery language about how great everything is there.	11	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Okay. Can I give you advance warning
Otherwise justice is not being seen to be done.	12	of a little bit of work that I'm going to be needing you
MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, we'll look at $$ I don't want you	13	to do on the persons unknown case $$
to be under the burden of having to argue every point	14	MS BOLTON: My Lord, yes.
that comes up in the trial at the beginning of the	15	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: which is that Ms Pressick's various
trial .	16	witness statements have, as a fairly regular feature,
MR CURTIN: Yes.	17	updated me on each occasion as to what has happened
MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: The sensible time for you to raise your	18	since the last hearing. That is evidence which is
argument about Ms Jarrett $$ and what you need to do is	19	likely to have its bearing on persons unknown because
sit down with her statement, go through it, marshall	20	it's essentially a recitation of what various events
your argument about why you say the relevant paragraphs	21	have happened and there are a series of what I'll call
of it are irrelevant to the issues the court has to	22	"persons unknown" who are said to have engaged in that.
decide and I will hear those arguments before we get to	23	I want a bit more, as it were, focus on identifying, as
	24	it were, these people.
		So what I want is —— so take, let's say,
41		43
managing your time. So focus on $$ look at the	1	hypothetically, Ms Pressick's third witness statement
timetable you've been given so that you know what	2	that says, in paragraphs 39 to $66$ — sets out two months
witnesses are coming on which day and then you can focus	3	worth of activities that have taken place. Essentially
your energies on raising any points you want to, for	4	I want each person unknown to be given an identifying
example about Ms Jarrett, on the day on which she's	5	characteristic, so PU1, PU2, PU3, PU4, so I've got
going to be giving evidence.	6	a scale of what the evidence has been about the number
Ms Bolton now knows that you're going to take an	7	of persons unknown and the extent of the activities that
objection to that and she's given me an indication now	8	are complained of in the evidence.
what her position is likely to be on that and we will	9	MS BOLTON: My Lord. My Lord, just to canvass with
have the argument on that day and I'll make a decision	10	your Lordship now $$ and it's one of the reasons for the
about it.	11	summary judgment application to cover them $$ it isn't
MR CURTIN: Yes, because mine is a simple objection, that if	12	to prevent anything from being looked at but from the
I can't ask it, she can't be allowed in the dock to give	13	point of view of the perspective $$ of how much is
this La La Land statement about all the animal	14	looked at, what we were proposing to do was to take
experiments if I can't	15	a large number of incidents for each persons unknown
MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, Ms Bolton has a point, which is,	16	category, but not every single one, because I have
if you wanted to run that argument, then you needed to	17	a feeling, if we do that, we have to watch literally
provide your evidence, as it were, to the counterpoint,	18	every video and I think $$
which may be why you were talking about a vet. But	19	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: I don't want to go in I don't want
I don't know. I mean, it's very late to be getting that	20	to delve into all of them. I want an order of magnitude
evidence now.	21	issue, which is that $$ one of the things I have
MR CURTIN: It is.	22	ultimately to consider is the extent of the wrongdoing,
MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: But, you know, if you do get it and you	23	what is being alleged, so to the extent that it's
can ——	24	trespass, to the extent that it's obstruction of access.
	which is relevant to the issues the court has to decide, if you were to ask those questions, almost certainly Ms Bolton will object and, if I don't think that you've demonstrated that the evidence or the answer to the question is going to be relevant to the issues I have to decide, then I will tell you that you can't ask the question.  MR CURTIN: Okay. Well, on one hand I would ask you now to strike out Wendy Jarrett's statement because of its flowery language about how great everything is there.  Otherwise justice is not being seen to be done.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, we'll look at —— I don't want you to be under the burden of having to argue every point that comes up in the trial at the beginning of the trial.  MR CURTIN: Yes.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: The sensible time for you to raise your argument about Ms Jarrett —— and what you need to do is sit down with her statement, go through it, marshall your argument about why you say the relevant paragraphs of it are irrelevant to the issues the court has to decide and I will hear those arguments before we get to the stage of Ms Jarrett's evidence; all right? But you will have a lot to do during the trial so it's about  41  managing your time. So focus on —— look at the timetable you've been given so that you know what witnesses are coming on which day and then you can focus your energies on raising any points you want to, for example about Ms Jarrett, on the day on which she's going to be giving evidence.  Ms Bolton now knows that you're going to take an objection to that and she's given me an indication now what her position is likely to be on that and we will have the argument on that day and I'll make a decision about it.  MR CURTIN: Yes, because mine is a simple objection, that if I can't ask it, she can't be allowed in the dock to give this La La Land statement about all the animal experiments if I can't ——  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, Ms Bolton has a point, which is, if you wanted to run that argument, then you needed to provide your evidence, as it were, to th	which is relevant to the issues the court has to decide, if you were to ask those questions, almost certainly  Ms Bolton will object and, if I don't think that you've demonstrated that the evidence or the answer to the question is going to be relevant to the issues I have to decide, then I will tell you that you can't ask the question.  MR CURTIN: Okay. Well, on one hand I would ask you now to strike out Wendy Jarrett's statement because of its flowery language about how great everything is there.  Otherwise justice is not being seen to be done.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Well, we'll look at — I don't want you to be under the burden of having to argue every point that comes up in the trial at the beginning of the trial.  MR CURTIN: Yes.  MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: The sensible time for you to raise your argument about Ms Jarrett — and what you need to do is sit down with her statement, go through it, marshall your argument about why you say the relevant paragraphs of it are irrelevant to the issues the court has to decide and I will hear those arguments before we get to the stage of Ms Jarrett's evidence; all right? But you and will have a lot to do during the trial so it's about  41  managing your time. So focus on —— look at the timetable you've been given so that you know what witnesses are coming on which day and then you can focus your energies on raising any points you want to, for example about Ms Jarrett, on the day on which she's going to be giving evidence.  Ms Bolton now knows that you're going to take an objection to that and she's given me an indication now what her position is likely to be on that and we will have the argument on that day and I'll make a decision about it.  MR CURTIN: Yes, because mine is a simple objection, that if I can't ask it, she can't be allowed in the dock to give 13 about it.  MR CURTIN: Yes, because mine is a simple objection, that if 12 I can't ask it, she can't be allowed in the dock to give 13 in this La La Land statement about all the animal experiments if I can't — 15 MR JUSTICE

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

1	I have a scale of it.	1	unknown case, granting summary judgment against persons
2	MS BOLTON: Yes, we've done that, my Lord. What you will	2	unknown might be thought to be a walk in the park to the
3	have $$ and you don't yet because in the versions that	3	extent that all you have to show is, "Oh, look, I've
4	we've got at the moment there was a few clarifications	4	done my alternative service order. We haven't got an
5	I need so I've written them into it $$ we will have	5	acknowledgement of service. Gosh, I could get judgment
6	schedules for you and we will take you through those	6	default or summary judgment". The tricky aspect is what
7	schedules	7	comes next, which is what remedy do you get on the back
8	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Okay.	8	of that.
9	MS BOLTON: $$ and that $$ incidences where the persons	9	MS BOLTON: Yes.
10	unknown are, at what times. So I'm going to take you	10	MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: One of the trickiest areas in this
11	through it category by category, and if it will assist	11	case $$ and this it won't come as a surprise to you, $I^\prime m$
12	the court, the court can have a copy of that.	12	sure $$ is the question of an exclusion zone. An
13	Yes, I hadn't expected the court to deal with it	13	exclusion zone as part of a final order is a very
14	from the point of view of, "Well, we've had loads and	14	different beast from an interim order because, unlike
15	loads of incidents and here's a few videos". We've	15	a PSPO, where the local authority can say, "We have
16	broken it down, we've got the moments that are relevant	16	balanced the rights and decided that we are going to
17	and we'll take your Lordship through them in that	17	exercise our legislative power to impose an exclusion
18	manner. But what we haven't done is $$ I mean,	18	zone" $$ fine, that's an exercise of legislation , no
19	sometimes there's $$ for some categories there's, say,	19	problem. For me, because as we've, on this journey
20	300 incidents. We haven't taken 300 incidents and	20	discovered, there are $$ it is possible to do something
21	tabled them because just the amount of time and videos,	21	in the exclusion zone which is covered by the terms of
22	but they are all large numbers of incidents. You'll	22	the injunction but not otherwise unlawful, so let's
23	have seen the cross-referencing. We section out where	23	say $$ well, I say "civilly unlawful", obstructing the
24	the cross-referencing is in the particulars of claim in	24	police van.
25	the schedule so you'll be able to link it to the	25	MS BOLTON: Yes.
	45		47

incident. Obviously there will also be persons unknown in the videos relevant to D11 and D20, which we would also highlight to you.

No, we had thought about that and it does obviously need to be marshalled in a way that's helpful to the

MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: That's fine. I'm not entirely sure exactly what a summary judgment gives you because --I can see the purpose of a summary judgment application. If you've got defendants who are present and you're just about to embark upon a very long trial, which -- in that type of case, there's a very real benefit of a summary judgment application because it means the court cuts out -- if the application is well founded, it cuts out perhaps days or even weeks of evidence.

16 MS BOLTON: Yes. 17 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: I perfectly understand the good sense 18 of that, but in a persons unknown case where there isn't 19 going to be any evidence and I'm going to have to 2.0 consider, at least on a sampling basis the categories of 21 persons unknown because it's going to be ultimately 2.2 a matter which is relevant to even -- it's not so much 23 judgment, it's more remedy.

24 MS BOLTON: Yes.

MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: And that's the -- in the persons

46

1 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: It's all very well for the court to 2. strike a happy medium and accommodation and a pragmatic 3 way of holding the ring pending a trial to do it through an exclusion zone. I'm not sure that I'm altogether 5 happy with the idea of going forward with that and 6 I don't know what the answer to that is and I don't know 7 because I haven't got that far -- I don't even know 8 whether it's in the bundle, but have you provided me 9 with a draft order that you're going to be seeking at 10 the end of all this? 11 MS BOLTON: My Lord, we have done. 12 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Does it include exclusion zone? 13 MS BOLTON: My Lord, it does for this reason: my 14 understanding of the authorities on exclusion zones at 15 final order is that they would have to be anchored to a cause of action usually. The court has discretion, 16 17 but it's not usually the way the court would deal with 18 final (inaudible), I entirely accept. 19 We will be saying that there are grounds for you to 2.0 do that on the causes of action and on the injunction 21 tests in this case because they serve a real purpose 2.2 that, on one of those causes of action, it would be 23 prohibiting a lawful act, but we say you will be able to 2.4 justify that under the refinement of the Ineos test that

48

took place in Cuadrilla. And secondly, one of the other

1 causes of action we say you should grant that anyway and 1 trial, you'll be very welcome and you're perfectly 2 that that is actually a good way of managing those 2 entitled to come and attend that trial. 3 breaches and those unlawful activities . So we say we 3 MR CURTIN: Can a person unknown -- can someone ask to cross-examine the witness of a person unknown? 4 can link them to the causes of action in this case, so 4 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: That's unlikely because, if I'm only 5 That would be the approach we would be taking. 5 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Okay, that's fine. going to be dealing with persons unknown, I'm not going 6 6 7 MS BOLTON: I understand --7 to require any of the witnesses to come and give their MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: We don't need to take time on it now. 8 8 evidence. There's no point because there's nobody to 9 If I had to identify -- of all of the bristlingly 9 cross-examine them. 10 10 MR CURTIN: Then do you take their statement as read? difficult issues I have to deal with, that's probably, 11 I regard, the thing that troubles me the most --11 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Yes. MS BOLTON: I'm alive to that, my Lord. MR CURTIN: That's scandalous. 12 12 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: -- because it is the issue about MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: It's not. Trust me, it's not. It's 13 13 prohibiting something that's lawful against a category a standard feature of civil litigation . Just because 14 14 15 of person unknown, so it's looking into the future and 15 they've said it and just because the evidence has been 16 16 admitted, I'm not bound to accept it. Also, probably in the court trying to imagine the circumstances and 17 prejudge them to an extent. And whilst there's 17 this case of more importance is the legal consequences 18 perfectly sensible authority based on the exclusion zone 18 of that evidence rather than there being a dispute. 19 around the victim's house, that's where you've got one 19 You've got to separate out, as it were, the facts and 2.0 2.0 largely there isn't going to be a large amount of person, so the court, as it were, is saying, "Okay, 21 based upon your conduct in the past, I am satisfied that 21 dispute about the facts because it's all on video evidence 22 this order is necessary and proportionate, et cetera, 22 MR CURTIN: Yes. 2.3 and to the extent it curtails your ability to do 2.3 2.4 something lawful, I'm satisfied that that's an 2.4 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: I know what's happened outside the 25 appropriate order to make because it's the only 2.5 facility . The more difficult question -- that's what 1 effective way of ensuring that there's no future 1 I've just been having this discussion with  $\ensuremath{\mathsf{Ms}}$  Bolton 2 breach" 2 about -- is what the legal consequences of that are, 3 MS BOLTON: Yes. 3 particularly in terms of an injunction against persons MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: But all of that is focused on an unknown. So whilst I wouldn't permit a person -- some individual. Where I find it difficult is trying to map 5 5 random member of the public that might be conceivably that across into a category of person who the order on 6 caught by the injunction order to come and question 6 7 7 the basis of the law as it stands is going to catch witnesses without, as it were, applying to join the 8 8 entire newcomers -proceedings, to the extent that anybody wanted to 9 MS BOLTON: Yes. 9 make -- when we get to the second phase, which is the 10 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN:  $\,--\,$  so this is people who the court 10 discussions about the legal consequences of what happens 11 isn't even aware of what they've done and they haven't 11 and what order the court might make against persons 12 yet done anything that would justify the court making an 12 unknown, then I'm not shutting the door to people who 13 13 order against them, and so I am curtailing what would have been engaged with these proceedings  $--\ \mbox{you}$  for 14 14 otherwise be their lawful right in advance. example or others that I recognise in the public gallery 15 MS BOLTON: Yes. 15 who have been previously defendants in the proceedings. 16 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: That's the issue. 16 I'm not shutting the door. 17 If you want to make notes and want to raise points 17 MS BOLTON: Yes, my Lord. 18 MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Anyway, let's -- I'm sure of a variety 18 that you think I should be considering, then I'm not 19 of very interesting points we're going to have to 19 shutting the door to giving you an opportunity, in 20 a short defined period of the trial  $\,--\,$  you telling me 2.0 consider, that is one of them that I would welcome 21 assistance on. 21 what you think I should have regard to or what points 2.2 MR CURTIN: All those points you will be having at trial 2.2 you think are important in dealing with the persons 23 unknown case. That's rather different. That's about 23 whether me or Ms Jaffrav are here or not?

50 52

2.4

25

legal submissions.

MR CURTIN: Thank you.

2.4

25

MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Correct. Mr Curtin, if you or

Ms Jaffray or anybody else wants to come along to that

```
MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: All right?
                                                                               1
                                                                                                            INDEX
 1
 2
            Right. Well, thank you, everybody. We will
                                                                               2
 3
         reconvene on Wednesday then. Mr Curtin, what have you
                                                                               3
 4
         got to do?
                                                                               4
                                                                                   Housekeeping and other matters
                                                                                                                   .....1
     MR CURTIN: I've got to do the statement of truth --
 5
                                                                               5
     MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Yes.
 6
                                                                               6
     MR CURTIN: -- I've got to put numbers on the paragraphs --
                                                                               7
 8
     MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: Yes.
                                                                               8
 9
     MR CURTIN: -- and if I do -- if I feel I've got the nerve
                                                                              9
10
         to add a little bit more evidence, I'll put it on
                                                                             10
         a separate document to this so you can say "It's all too
11
                                                                             11
12
         late".
                                                                              12
13
     MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: To them. And a statement of truth on
                                                                             13
14
         anything that you want to admit as evidence, and if it's
                                                                             14
15
         late, it's an important consideration for you to explain
                                                                             15
         to me why it's late; all \mbox{right?} Do that in a separate
16
                                                                             16
17
                                                                             17
         witness statement.
18
     MR CURTIN: (Inaudible - overspeaking) because I do rely on
                                                                             18
19
         and I've asked continually to be allowed for my verbal
                                                                             19
20
         evidence to actually be evidence.
                                                                             20
2.1
     MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: It doesn't work like that, Mr Curtin,
                                                                             2.1
2.2
         but it's not unreasonable because if you are in
                                                                             2.2
2.3
                                                                             2.3
         a position to tell me what you want me to hear, you're
24
         in a position to write it down. So just write it down.
                                                                              24
         The important thing is you've made certain references
                                                                                                                55
 1
          earlier today about the difficulties you've had in
                                                                                                                56
 2.
         preparing for this case.
 3
     MR CURTIN: Yes.
     MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: If you want to tell me more about that,
 5
         write it down and put a statement of truth on the bottom
 6
         of it and send it to the claimants and put paragraph
 7
         numbers on it.
     MR CURTIN: Yes.
 8
 9
     MR JUSTICE NICKLIN: All right? Right. Thank you,
10
         everybody. We'll sit again at 10.30 on Wednesday.
11
     (11.54 am)
12
                    (The hearing adjourned until
13
               Wednesday, 26 April 2023 at 10.30 am)
14
15
16
17
18
19
2.0
21
22
23
2.4
25
```

Opus 2 transcripts@opus2.com
Official Court Reporters 020 4518 8448

ability (2) 31:25 49:23 able (12) 2:4 11:22 12:13 24:17 26:23 35:6 37:13 40:16 42:25 43:1 45:25 48:23 absence (1) 20:9 absent (1) 23:24 absolutely (4) 27:19 32:6 40:2,3 accept (4) 23:22 30:20 48:18 51:16 acceptable (1) 32:15 accepted (2) 22:18 30:13 access (3) 38:19 39:6 44:24 accommodation (1) 48:2 accordance (1) 23:10 account (3) 5:18 29:9 39:4 acknowledgement (2) 16:21 acres (7) 26:10 27:24 35:18 36:7,23 38:13 39:20 across (1) 50:6 action (6) 24:12 48:16,20,22 49:1.4 activities (5) 27:11 38:17 44:3,7 49:3 actually (9) 3:19 9:7 18:8 19:19 23:3 30:7 34:7 49:2 53:20 add (2) 25:11 53:10 address (1) 16:3 adducing (1) 35:2 adjourn (2) 10:11 15:25 adjourned (2) 19:15 54:12 adjourning (1) 19:8 adjournment (1) 20:23 adjudicate (2) 9:6 28:15 adjudicating (2) 34:16 38:23 admissible (3) 28:10 34:1,3 admit (1) 53:14 admitted (2) 6:3 51:16 adopt (1) 6:22 advance (4) 26:2 40:20 43:11 50:14 advancing (1) 4:2 adversarial (2) 23:20 24:5 advocate (1) 17:17 affecting (1) 4:16 after (5) 9:24 10:6 13:4 18:7 32:13 again (2) 28:24 54:10 against (19) 5:7 6:25 8:11 10:17 11:5 17:7,14,15 20:21 22:20 23:7 26:22 38:17,21 47:1 49:14 50:13 52:3.11 ago (2) 16:9.10 agree (1) 8:6 ah (1) 13:23 ahead (3) 15:16 20:14 22:20 air (1) 31:4 alive (1) 49:12 allegations (4) 23:21 38:16.20 39:23 alleged (5) 5:6 6:24 38:18 39:24 44:23 allow (3) 7:9 15:15 16:1 allowed (5) 8:10 22:22 25:2 42:13 53:19 allows (1) 12:19 almost (3) 8:4 25:25 41:3 along (6) 14:6 22:8 23:21 34:5,5 50:25 already (3) 6:7,8 13:2 also (10) 2:11 11:4,10 12:11,18 14:1 31:5 46:1,3 51:16 alternative (3) 15:16 23:10 47.4 altogether (1) 48:4 amendment (1) 2:13 amount (2) 45:21 51:20 analysis (1) 27:2

angry (1) 35:10 balanced (1) 47:16 animal (3) 34:5,15 42:14 bang (1) 24:25 animals (2) 33:6,18 bargain (1) 18:3 anonymity (1) 32:21 barristers (1) 22:11 based (4) 17:20 23:20 another (1) 4:7 answer (6) 22:18 24:3 30:11 49:18,21 38:3 41:5 48:6 basis (8) 6:23 7:16,18 12:25 anxious (1) 8:3 20:15 27:2 46:20 50:7 anybody (4) 5:10 24:2 50:25 battery (1) 34:4 beagle (1) 39:22 52.8 anyone (1) 37:15 bearing (2) 8:9 43:19 anything (13) 1:15 3:25 5:15 bears (1) 7:12 8:5 14:6 18:12 25:5.11 beast (1) 47:14 33:5 43:9 44:12 50:12 became (1) 22:7 become (2) 10:18 17:24 53:14 anyway (5) 10:17 17:22 becomes (1) 11:13 before (7) 2:2,15 4:20 13:6 24:25 49:1 50:18 apart (1) 25:5 14:15 34:6 41:23 began (1) 22:12 apologise (1) 28:25 appear (3) 1:5 28:7 38:5 beginning (1) 41:15 appears (2) 15:12 28:7 behalf (2) 1:5 20:11 application (13) 2:16,18 7:9 being (19) 1:17 6:8 10:21 8:10 11:11 18:21,23,25 11:7 15:24 17:15 20:18 19:3 44:11 46:9,13,14 21:23 24:13 33:18 applications (2) 8:8 18:24 35:25,25 36:16 37:15 apply (1) 8:2 38:18 41:12 44:12,23 applying (1) 52:7 51-18 appreciate (4) 11:16 17:3 helief (3) 27:11 35:15 37:4 22:10 30:14 beliefs (5) 30:5,8,15 36:25 appreciated (1) 11:17 38:1 appreciates (1) 30:9 believe (4) 16:6 27:24 32:25 approach (3) 6:22 13:8 49:5 benefit (2) 12:11 46:12 approaching (1) 5:2 appropriate (1) 49:25 best (3) 4:21 11:8 19:18 april (2) 1:1 54:13 better (4) 5:7 9:5,6 19:23 areas (2) 37:25 47:10 between (2) 27:21 38:1 arent (1) 37:2 beyond (1) 16:7 bit (10) 10:3 16:8,14 argue (1) 41:14 arguing (1) 17:14 19:21.21 24:11 29:11 argument (7) 25:22 34:14 43:12,23 53:10 40:20 41:19,21 42:10,17 blown (1) 25:4 arguments (4) 7:18 31:25 bolton (84) 1:3,5,13,20 39:13 41:23 2:6,11,25 3:3,10,22 4:16 around (1) 49:19 5:25 6:5.18 7:5.19 8:6.12.14.21 9:10.17 arrangements (2) 31:19 10:5,9,13,16,22,24 11:3,10 32:11 article (1) 26:21 12:9,18,22 13:9,19,20,22,24,25 articles (1) 3:5 ask (20) 4:12 6:14 11:24 14:7,12,20 15:6,13,18 16:6 18:1 20:14,23 18:7,20 21:2,10 23:5 21:6.18.24 31:4.10 35:6.14 25:13.18 28:9.21 29:24 38:4 41:3.7.9 42:13 51:3 30:1 32:3.19.25 33:9.12 asked (2) 30:7 53:19 34:17 35:5 41:4 42:7.16 asking (7) 4:1 6:23 7:1,2 43:10,14 44:9 45:2,9 17:21 36:12 40:13 46:16,24 47:9,25 48:11,13 aspect (2) 5:19 47:6 49:7,12 50:3,9,15,17 52:1 aspects (2) 17:9 39:17 boltons (4) 19:3,12 39:9,13 assessment (1) 27:3 bona (1) 37:4 assist (1) 45:11 boss (1) 37:10 assistance (3) 30:2 31:2 bottom (3) 13:15 14:1 54:5 50:21 bound (1) 51:16 assuming (5) 19:7 23:9 breach (1) 50:2 39:1,1,13 breaches (1) 49:3 astounding (1) 22:23 breakdown (1) 16:14 attached (2) 3:1 5:21 breaking (1) 40:10 bred (1) 37:15 attend (5) 10:4 23:16 32:11,18 51:2 breeding (1) 35:23 attendance (1) 32:6 brescia (1) 5:21 bring (6) 12:16 24:21 25:5 attended (1) 37:1 attending (1) 33:1 33:20.21 34:18 attention (1) 12:17 bringing (1) 28:6 attitude (2) 18:25 21:15 bristlingly (1) 49:9 attract (1) 37:25 broadly (1) 31:17 authorities (2) 8:1 48:14 broken (1) 45:16 authority (2) 47:15 49:18 brought (2) 26:15 34:19 available (4) 10:4,6,7,10 bundle (1) 48:8 avoid (1) 8:4 burden (1) 41:14

campaign (1) 16:16 cannot (3) 1:7 9:14 25:5 cant (16) 1:14 3:24 5:9 8:7 14:25 16:11 17:16 18:12 20:10 26:16 37:18 38:6 41:7 42:13,13,15 canvass (1) 44:9 carrying (4) 28:1 34:8 38:11,14 cases (2) 17:5 23:15 catastrophe (1) 43:4 catch (1) 50:7 categorical (1) 40:10 categories (2) 45:19 46:20 category (6) 23:11 44:16 45:11,11 49:14 50:6 caught (1) 52:6 cause (3) 2:7 3:19 48:16 causes (6) 7:14 26:3 48:20.22 49:1.4 centre (1) 35:24 certain (1) 53:25 cetera (1) 49:22 challenged (2) 35:16,18 challenges (1) 24:7 chance (2) 18:8 20:22 change (1) 34:7 chappy (1) 16:19 characteristic (1) 44:5 charged (1) 10:21 charges (1) 10:25 check (1) 23:8 cheeky (2) 16:19 24:14 chief (1) 4:9 choices (1) 36:12 circumstances (1) 49:16 civil (5) 13:17 23:19 36:21 39:15 51:14 civilly (1) 47:23 claimant (3) 30:18 31:1 33:10 claimants (12) 1:6 14:2 24:3 26:4 27:12,25 28:13 30:25 31:7 34:20 38:24 54:6 clarifications (1) 45:4 clear (14) 2:21 4:19 6:6 8:1 10:9,24,25 22:7 30:17,22 32:6 33:3 34:25 40:17 clearly (1) 17:7 clients (3) 4:22 7:14 14:25 clinical (1) 33:17 close (2) 9:24 34:24 closed (2) 33:10.22 come (16) 5:9 6:12 8:23 16:1 18:7 19:16 29:8 32:8,12 34:4 43:5 47:11 50:25 51:2,7 52:6 comes (5) 23:21 37:10 40:14 41:15 47:7 coming (3) 19:8 25:1 42:3 comments (1) 40:2 common (2) 26:17 35:7 communication (1) 20:13 company (3) 27:13 28:1 40:6 complained (1) 44:8 complaint (1) 12:23 complaints (1) 8:19 compliance (1) 7:25 complicated (4) 23:1 24:16 25:6.21 complication (1) 22:6 complied (2) 7:7 18:18 comply (4) 8:19 13:1,10 29-15 conceivably (1) 52:5 concern (1) 30:6 concerned (1) 37:6 concerns (3) 15:19 27:6 39:22 conclude (1) 39:4 conclusions (1) 27:3 conditions (2) 24:21 26:10 conduct (2) 17:11 49:21 conducting (2) 17:4 20:19 confirm (1) 14:4

conflict (2) 27:21 37:25 conscious (1) 9:13 consequence (1) 33:22 consequences (4) 21:17 51:17 52:2.10 consider (12) 3:14 12:14 13:12 14:23.23 18:8 29:5,10 39:8 44:22 46:20 50:20 consideration (4) 7:12 29:5.18 53:15 considered (1) 7:18 considering (1) 52:18 consistent (1) 17:16 consists (1) 3:4 contain (1) 6:2 content (2) 19:18 20:14 contents (1) 14:4 contesting (1) 40:9 context (2) 28:22 36:22 continually (1) 53:19 continue (1) 43:7 control (1) 40:25 controversial (1) 36:1 convenient (1) 8:23 convictions (1) 27:23 copied (1) 1:24 copy (4) 12:3,5 13:25 45:12 correct (2) 18:13 50:24 costs (1) 8:5 couldnt (1) 6:12 counterpoint (1) 42:18 country (1) 23:20 couple (3) 10:13 13:7 30:2 course (5) 5:7 15:20 19:18 20:12 32:17 courts (9) 1:9,18 8:20 9:8 13:2 18:18 21:24 29:6,15 cover (1) 44:11 covered (2) 32:20 47:21 cpr31a (1) 17:22 criminal (1) 1:9 criticism (1) 14:13 crossexamine (4) 3:25 22:22 51:4.9 crossexamined (2) 5:1 11:18 crossreferencing (2) 45:23,24 crunch (1) 22:12 cuadrilla (1) 48:25 curtailing (1) 50:13 curtails (1) 49:23 curtin (97) 1:6 2:12.15 3:14,23 4:10 5:8,10,12 6:6 8:11 11:11,12,17,21 12:4,6,15,22 13:21 16:3,6,17,18 17:1,2 18:10,16 19:5,13,19 20:10.13.22 21:4.25 22:11.15.25 23:17 24:8 25:9.15.19 26:5.12 27:19 28:5.16.18.19.24 29:4,16,23 30:3,5,8,17 31:16 35:5,6,13,14,20 36:3,14,18 37:8,20 38:3.10.12 39:18.25 40:17 41:9,17 42:12,22,25 43:3 50:22.24 51:3.10.12.23 52:25 53:3.5.7.9.18.21 54:3.8 curtins (5) 2:23 5:4 6:23 8:19 9:9 cuts (2) 46:13,14 cvp (2) 2:1,2 d11 (2) 22:5 46:2 d20 (1) 46:2 dad (1) 16:14

damage (1) 27:15

damaged (1) 28:3

date (1) 4:8

dawned (1) 22:6

42:3.5.10

dark (2) 16:13 24:11

day (8) 1:21 6:5,13 9:23 29:1

daytoday (1) 31:24 deadline (4) 6:7 16:24 17:1 29:15 deal (19) 4:22 5:6 8:15,16 12:20 18:5 21:1.2 24:9 26:11 28:18 30:3,13 31:24 37:14 43:9 45:13 48:17 49-10 dealing (4) 11:16 35:8 51:6 52:22 dealt (2) 2:19 4:4 death (1) 29:20 debate (2) 5:20 33:16 decide (8) 3:17 7:6 21:19 34:11 40:21 41:2,7,23 decided (1) 47:16 decides (1) 10:18 decision (7) 2:20 5:21 7:16 26:1 40:19,23 42:10 deepseat (1) 27:23 default (8) 6:24,24 7:21 13:2 21:23 24:10 29:10 47:6 defences (2) 34:18 35:2 defendants (5) 32:17 34:3 39:22 46:10 52:15 defending (1) 16:9 defined (3) 17:7 23:12 52:20 delay (2) 6:20 22:13 delve (1) 44:20 demonstrate (1) 37:4 demonstrated (2) 38:24 41:5 demonstrating (2) 5:14 39.14 deny (1) 23:22 depending (3) 2:20 10:16 13:8 depends (1) 10:18 derail (2) 4:21 8:5 described (1) 2:23 detain (1) 5:23 didnt (4) 6:9 9:24 29:15 30:14 died (1) 16:15 different (6) 1:16,18,18 5:1 47:14 52:23 difficult (5) 17:5,9 49:10 50:5 51:25 difficulties (7) 2:3,7 14:25 17:3 29:14.19 54:1 difficulty (1) 40:23 digest (1) 7:17 direction (2) 4:7 15:20 directions (1) 7:8 disadvantages (1) 31:13 discharge (1) 17:17 discovered (1) 47:20 discretion (4) 33:13,24 34:2 48:16 discussion (1) 52:1 discussions (1) 52:10 disgust (1) 26:17 disgusted (1) 26:16 dispute (5) 5:13,14 24:22 51:18.21 disputes (1) 5:5 disputing (1) 5:9 disrupt (1) 13:11 divorced (1) 32:1 dock (1) 42:13 document (15) 2:24 5:4,16 11:13 14:10,17,23 15:4 18:9.14 19:11 21:9.16 25:14 53:11 documents (7) 2:17 6:11 11:6 20:24 22:2.4 31:20 does (11) 4:16 6:13 7:15 11:8 23:1,16 28:21 33:7 46:4 48:12,13 doesnt (15) 1:23 3:19,24

12:2 26:21

dog (1) 24:23

27:4,7,10,14,15,16 36:20

37:24 39:20 53:21

dogs (3) 26:17 35:11 40:7

days (8) 1:18 8:24 9:19.20

10:6 15:10 19:7 46:15

doing (5) 3:13 5:14 9:21 39-10-21 done (11) 11:25 39:9,24 41:12 43:4 45:2.18 47:4 48:11 50:11.12 dont (43) 1:13,22,24 3:12,16,25 4:5,13,20 5:13 6:16,20 7:20 15:14 16:19 18:1 19:8 21:9 24:2.11.16.18 26:6 28:19 31:7.13 32:7 34:12 35:13.15.16.37:22.40:18 41:4.13 42:20 44:19.19 45:3 48:6,6,7 49:8 door (3) 52:12,16,19 doubt (1) 5:12 down (11) 22:17 28:24 29:13 32:8 33:23 40:9 41:20 45:16 53:24.24 54:5 draft (1) 48:9 drawn (1) 27:4 dropbox (2) 3:6 6:15 due (1) 16:15 dumped (1) 21:6 during (1) 41:25 dwell (1) 36:5

earlier (1) 54:1 easier (1) 15:23 easily (1) 14:25 easy (1) 22:4 effect (2) 9:23 34:9 effective (1) 50:1 either (2) 20:5 28:15 electronically (1) 11:7 eleventh (1) 13:5 else (4) 20:4 25:5 40:8 50:25 elsewhere (2) 15:11 20:1 email (1) 2:17 emailed (1) 10:5 embark (1) 46:11 emergency (1) 37:14 emotion (1) 35:9 employees (6) 27:17,17 28:2 36:6,11 37:6 employment (1) 36:12 enable (1) 1:25 enables (1) 17:8 encouraging (1) 25:11 end (4) 7:22 14:21 31:19 48:10 energies (1) 42:4 engaged (3) 43:6,22 52:13 enormous (2) 4:24 23:25 enquire (1) 37:5 enquiries (1) 21:11 ensure (2) 17:12 31:21 ensuring (1) 50:1 entire (1) 50:8 entirely (3) 27:7 46:7 48:18 entitled (4) 27:6 33:21 36:15 51:2 envisage (1) 24:11 equally (1) 8:2 especially (1) 40:1 essentially (5) 5:12,17 14:3 43:20 44:3 et (1) 49:22 even (9) 8:7 27:7 32:9 33:23 36:5 46:15,22 48:7 50:11 event (2) 11:3 32:1 events (1) 43:20 every (6) 13:9 14:2 41:14 43:5 44:16,18 everybody (7) 8:4 11:20 12:25 27:1 31:16 53:2 54:10 everyone (1) 28:25 everything (3) 31:21 40:4 41.11 everythings (1) 35:23

anchored (1) 48:15

aware (6) 10:24 11:25

14:5,15 15:3 50:11

away (3) 7:12 25:13 34:11

back (8) 8:23 15:15 16:1

18:7 19:9,14,16 47:7

bad (2) 27:9 29:2

balance (2) 28:5 39:2

business (3) 9:25 28:1.2

call (6) 4:6.17 34:4 35:7

called (6) 3:1 4:11 13:4,14

confirmed (1) 10:5

busload (1) 23:13

40:15 43:21

camp (1) 39:22

31:8.9

evidence (57) 2:12

25:17 26:9 27:3

3:2,15,16,24,25 4:9,25

6:25 7:10,14 15:2 21:19

28:9.10.20.22 31:4.6.10 32-15 23 33-20 21 34:1.19.19.22.25.35:2 38:25 39:3.4.23 40:24 41:1.5.24 42:6.18.21 43:18 44:6,8 46:15,19 51:8.15.18.22 53:10,14,20,20 exactly (2) 20:16 46:8 example (8) 5:20 15:1 17:21 24:15 29:20 37:8 42:5 52:14 excellent (1) 13:23 exclude (1) 21:18 exclusion (8) 47:12,13,17,21 48:4,12,14 49:18 exercise (2) 47:17,18 exhausted (1) 25:7 expect (1) 26:12 expected (1) 45:13 expecting (1) 26:14 experience (1) 31:25 experiments (1) 42:15 expert (3) 28:7,9,22 expertise (1) 33:3 experts (1) 34:4 explain (3) 29:13,22 53:15 explained (2) 2:16 29:1 exploration (1) 38:7 express (2) 27:1,6 expressing (1) 27:8 expression (1) 26:25 extent (14) 4:25 5:5 7:13 19:1 27:12 32:7 44.7 22 23 24 47.3 49:17.23 52:8 extra (1) 25:3

face (3) 8:18 24:7 26:1 facebook (1) 3:5 facility (2) 33:22 51:25 factors (1) 29:9 factory (2) 35:8 37:14 failed (1) 13:10 failure (2) 8:19 21:16 fair (2) 9:14 17:13 fairer (1) 11:3 fairest (2) 11:5 20:2 fairly (4) 4:5 6:22 20:20 43:16 fairminded (1) 27:2 fairness (3) 10:14 21:2 34:20 familiar (1) 32:24 far (6) 7:11 17:6,8 29:24 34:10 48:7 fathers (1) 29:20 favour (1) 26:19 fear (1) 19:20 feature (3) 34:17 43:16 51:14 feel (5) 19:19 22:16,16 23:2 53:9 feeling (1) 44:17 few (2) 45:4,15 fides (1) 37:4 file (1) 25:10 filed (4) 2:12 5:8 6:8,10 final (3) 47:13 48:15,18 finally (1) 25:7 find (5) 10:20 22:2,3 30:11 50:5 findings (1) 39:7 fine (7) 12:7 35:23 40:4 43:2 46:7 47:18 49:6 finished (1) 25:7 first (11) 2:20 3:21 4:9 5:25 6:5,18 10:6 13:13 16:3 30:3 33:17 fix (1) 18:19 flag (1) 2:8 flowery (1) 41:11 focus (5) 3:18 9:7 42:1,3

footage (1) 3:6 form (2) 14:3 23:9 formally (1) 5:8 fortunately (1) 8:24 forward (2) 39:16 48:5 found (1) 22:23 founded (1) 46:14 free (1) 20:1 freedom (1) 26:24 friday (1) 9:25 frightened (1) 35:25 full (1) 40:2 function (1) 17:18 fundamental (1) 39:17 further (3) 12:19 25:16 30:21 future (3) 39:11 49:15 50:1

hatred (1) 16:15 havent (12) 2:15 6:15 11:22 18:18 25:25 28:8 34:20 45:18.20 47:4 48:7 50:11 having (8) 3:17 12:14 13:10 24:5 32:8 41:14 50:22 52:1 hear (10) 8:7 9:22 11:8 15:8 20:21 21:20,20 23:5 41:23 53:23 heard (6) 4:10 12:2,22 28:11 32:13 33:4 gallery (1) 52:14 hearing (4) 22:7 43:6.18 gates (1) 37:11 54:12 gathered (1) 16:7 hears (2) 15:18 31:16 gave (1) 4:7 held (1) 36:25 general (1) 16:20 help (2) 23:3 40:16 genuinely (1) 22:17 helpful (5) 11:12,19 12:4 get (14) 4:15 9:1 16:24 23:1 14:18 46:5 24-17 25-9 33-15 35-9 helping (1) 24:2 40:11 41:23 42:23 47:5.7 here (12) 1:7,7 8:4 9:20 52:9 15:23 16:2,7 19:24 getting (1) 42:20 20:18,20 31:13 50:23 give (17) 3:15,24 7:10 heres (1) 45:15 11:10,23 12:11,12 hers (1) 20:15 27:14,15,16 29:17 31:5 hes (3) 5:13,20 11:18 32:4,15 42:13 43:11 51:7 hesitation (1) 10:2 given (7) 7:10 14:9 15:24 higgledypiggledy (1) 16:8 28:8 42:2.8 44:4 high (1) 35:9 gives (4) 12:15 14:24 36:25 highlight (2) 11:12 46:3 46:8 highly (1) 26:8 giving (7) 5:17 6:25 29:7 himself (1) 30:12 31:10,14 42:6 52:19 hmmhmm (1) 22:24 goes (1) 11:18 hold (2) 24:17 35:17 going (64) 3:11 4:24 5:23 holding (1) 48:3 6:2,21 7:6 8:17,25 9:1 home (1) 40:8 12:1.18 13:11 14:21.22 honest (1) 16:12 15:6.10.11.22 18:2.5.7 honestly (1) 27:5 19:1,20 20:1,18,22 24:19 honesty (1) 35:15 25:9,13 26:8,10,13,13 hope (1) 2:4 27:17 28:14 31:8,8,23 hoped (1) 21:25 33:14 34:18 35:16 36:5 hopefully (1) 16:23 37:3.21.21.38:23.39:16.20 hoping (1) 22:9 41:6 42:6.7 43:12 45:10 hour (2) 13:5 20:23 46:19.19.21 47:16 48:5.9 hours (2) 15:5 21:7 50:7.19 51:6.6.20 house (1) 49:19 gone (1) 16:7 housekeeping (2) 1:4 55:4 good (11) 1:5,19 3:7 9:18 hypothetical (2) 22:19 37:8

13:23 20:6,13 28:24 32:2

46:17 49:2

govuk (1) 13:17

government (1) 13:16

grant (3) 6:24 34:9 49:1

granting (2) 33:13 47:1

grateful (3) 7:19 9:10 12:20

grounds (2) 34:13 48:19

guard (3) 37:9.13 40:13

guilty (2) 38:18 39:14

grass (2) 19:21,21

great (1) 41:11

greater (1) 25:22

group (1) 44:25

guards (1) 38:6

guide (1) 35:21

guided (1) 19:1

habits (1) 29:2

hadnt (1) 45:13

handed (1) 12:7

hands (1) 12:9

handbook (1) 13:21

43:17,21 51:24

happily (1) 21:8

happens (5) 18:6 30:16

35:18 37:11 52:10

happened (6) 16:9.11 24:10

hand (1) 41:9

gosh (1) 47:5

happy (7) 19:15,17 24:22

31:12.18 48:2.5

harassment (1) 36:17

hardy (1) 31:5

harm (1) 38:6

harmful (1) 38:3

hasnt (2) 7:7 31:1

hat (2) 24:24 25:2

id (6) 16:3,6 20:2,14 23:5 24:9 idea (1) 48:5 ideal (1) 1:17 identify (1) 49:9 identifying (2) 43:23 44:4 idiotoroof (1) 22:5 ill (13) 9:6 21:19.19.20 28:24 31:16 33:5 39:8 40:22,22 42:10 43:21 53:10 im (59) 1:19 4:24 7:19 8:3,17 9:2,10,12,17,21 10:24,24,25 12:1,9,20 14:5 16:8.18 20:15 23:14 24:12.13 25:11.20.25 26:14 30:8 31:12,14,14,15,17,18 32:16.19 33:15 35:4 36:21,21 40:19 42:25 43:6,12 45:10 46:7,19 47:11 48:4.4 49:12.24 50:18 51:5.6.16 52:12.16.18 imagine (2) 12:12 49:16 immediately (1) 10:21 impact (7) 11:15 33:2,7,9,14

hypothetically (1) 44:1

importance (3) 7:25 14:16 51.17 important (12) 3:22 4:4,20 7:12 15:17 17:24 29:18 36:22 38:10 52:22 53:15.25 impose (1) 47:17 impossible (1) 38:1 inaudible (7) 16:18 20:25 28:5 35:24 43:3 48:18 53-18 incidences (1) 45:9 incident (1) 46:1 incidents (5) 44:15 45:15,20,20,22 inclined (1) 34:13 include (1) 48:12 inconvenienced (1) 32:7 incredibly (1) 4:14 independent (1) 17:18 index (1) 55:1 indicate (1) 30:19 indicated (1) 30:4 indicating (1) 5:5 indication (2) 9:10 42:8 individual (2) 39:22 50:5 ineos (1) 48:24 informed (1) 7:16 initial (1) 5:15 injunction (8) 30:20 33:13 34:8 39:16 47:22 48:20 inquiry (2) 38:11,14 inside (2) 24:21 26:10 insofar (1) 15:19 intention (1) 30:23

knows (3) 15:2 37:10 42:7 interesting (1) 50:19 interests (1) 21:1 la (4) 40:2,2 42:14,14 interim (1) 47:14 land (6) 27:15 38:20 39:6,7 internet (1) 13:16 40:2 42:14 intimidate (1) 27:17 language (1) 41:11 intimidated (1) 28:2 large (3) 44:15 45:22 51:20 intimidation (1) 36:17 into (16) 11:14 14:18 24:22 29:3.9 33:15 34:13 37:17

38:7,13,14 39:4 44:20 45:5

49:15 50:6

investigated (1) 25:25

investigates (1) 39:20

investigating (1) 39:21

irrelevant (6) 10:19 28:11.13

44:11 46:18 50:11 51:20

issues (9) 3:23 11:14 28:15

34:11 40:21 41:2,6,22

its (107) 1:13.16.17 2:8.14

12:10,18 13:20,22,23

3:13.22 4:11.16.20 5:12

6:2 7:3,22 9:11,23 11:7,15

14:13,13 15:7,17,24 16:23

24:1.3.10.10.22.22.25:6.23

26:7.13 27:21 28:4.11.12

33:12,12 34:1,6,14 35:23

36:9,9,22 37:11,14,16,16

40:4,5,6,7,21,25 41:10,25

44:10.23.24 46:21.22.23

29:2,8 30:6 31:1 32:14

17-4 18-12 17 19-20 22

21:1,8 22:3,4,18

38:2.9.13 39:9

42:20.25 43:19.20

48:1.8.17 49:15.25

53:11,14,15,16,22

16:6,13,14,15,24 17:6

26:16 28:11.20 29:1

52:1 53:5,7,9,19

19:20 20:13 21:23 23:2

32:13.13 33:4 40:14.17

43:3.4.5 44:5 45:5 47:3

51:13.13.13.21

ive (33) 2:22 5:3,14

involve (1) 39:21

involved (1) 14:14

33:6 37:5 41:22

49:10

items (1) 21:13

isnt (7) 24:6 30:5 33:16

largely (6) 4:25 5:5 19:1 31:12 36:20 51:20 last (7) 4:19 15:4 16:23 22:6,8 25:7 43:18 late (12) 2:11 4:14 6:13 12:24 18:6,12 25:23 29:8 42:20 53:12.15.16 lateness (2) 7:13 18:17 later (3) 3:15 21:15 24:9 latest (1) 13:5 lawful (6) 27:25 28:1 48:23 49:14,24 50:14 least (5) 4:22 6:1 11:20 12:13 46:20

leave (5) 13:6 22:20 37:12 38:5 40:6 leaves (1) 24:8 left (2) 23:18 35:11 legal (6) 14:14 40:6 51:17 52:2,10,24 legally (1) 32:2 legislation (2) 34:6 47:18

legislative (1) 47:17

let (1) 2:21 lets (8) 3:20 5:6 19:14 33:19 40:10 43:25 47:22 50:18 level (2) 19:2 35:21 like (15) 14:15 16:3,20 19:19 20:18 22:11,16,17 23:2,16 26:3 28:7 29:2 35:10 53:21 likely (7) 7:23 8:5 25:22 26:7

limit (2) 33:15 37:2 limited (1) 4:1 limits (1) 38:15 line (1) 14:6 lines (1) 20:13 link (5) 1:25 2:4 3:6 45:25 49-4

30:11 42:9 43:19

links (4) 3:4.5 6:15 13:17 lisa (2) 22:8,19 list (2) 1:15 3:2 listen (3) 7:15 9:3 40:22 listening (1) 15:23

literally (2) 5:3 44:17 litigant (2) 12:25 13:5 litigants (3) 2:18 8:2 31:23 litigation (11) 17:4,10 jaffray (15) 1:7,25 9:14,20 23:19.25 24:1 26:11 10:3.14 15:10.15.18 16:1 36:4,21,23 38:15 51:14 little (3) 29:11 43:12 53:10 loads (2) 45:14,15 local (1) 47:15 jarrett (8) 28:6,7,18 33:1,2 long (9) 5:24 19:21,21 21:9.10.10 25:6 31:18 46:11 look (12) 3:12 4:25 8:22 job (6) 24:1,4 35:6 37:6,11 12:19 13:15 14:8 17:3,23 35:3 41:13 42:1 47:3 looked (4) 6:15 30:18 44:12,14 looking (2) 33:15 49:15 lordship (6) 4:7 6:6 9:12 30:4 44:10 45:17 lordships (1) 2:20 lot (3) 15:23 16:15 41:25

lucky (1) 10:20

М

makes (3) 9:18 23:21 25:12

making (5) 12:23 26:1 31:15

magistrates (1) 1:13

magnitude (1) 44:20

40:19 50:12

kind (1) 22:5 know (29) 1:12.14.20.22.24.24 4:5 6:16 8:8 11:6 14:6 19:23 24:11.18.24 25:8 26:12 31:7 32:22 35:10 37:12 40:14 42:2,20,23 48:6,6,7 knowledge (1) 17:20

jacklin (1) 31:5

50:23,25

40.25

ioin (2) 2:4 52:7

journey (1) 47:19

judges (1) 24:4

judge (2) 17:16 24:1

judgment (9) 8:7 44:11

justify (2) 48:24 50:12

46:8,9,13,23 47:1,5,6

jaffrays (1) 19:23

34:9 41:19 42:5

jarretts (6) 28:20 34:25

39:25 40:1 41:10,24

20-11 22-19 31-13

man (1) 22:8 manage (2) 7:3 17:6 managed (1) 16:24 management (1) 34:12 managing (2) 42:1 49:2 manner (1) 45:18 manning (3) 37:10 38:4 40.13 many (1) 39:8 map (1) 50:5 markou (1) 31:5 marshall (3) 7:17 31:25 41:20 marshalled (1) 46:5 material (3) 3:18 7:4 13:6 matter (6) 1:6,23 9:12 34:6 36:20 46:22 matters (5) 1:4 4:23 11:16 15:2 55:4 mavbe (1) 16:8 mbr (9) 24:21 26:10,17 27:24 35:18 36:7,23 38:13 39:20 mbrs (1) 26:13 mean (4) 6:13 34:12 42:20 45:18 means (3) 14:24 15:21 46:13 medium (1) 48:2 member (1) 52:5 mental (1) 16:14 mentioned (1) 29:19 merits (2) 4:23 34:14 met (1) 25:22 might (8) 10:18 11:12 13:4 14:5 29:12 47:2 52:5.11 mine (2) 26:15 42:12 misplaced (1) 27:7 missed (2) 6:7 16:25 mistake (1) 1:22 misunderstood (1) 36:21 moment (7) 3:23 4:6 16:17 18:19 28:23 40:23 45:4 moments (1) 45:16 monday (1) 1:1 monitor (1) 31:21 months (2) 40:14 44:2 more (20) 3:13 9:1 16:25 17:9 19:21,21 25:11,20,21 29:12 37:8 39:5 40:19 43:9.23 46:23 51:17.25 53:10 54:4 morning (9) 1:5 2:23 4:10 5:4 6:10,12 9:13 21:7 35:12

most (3) 7:12 37:25 49:11

moving (1) 34:5

ms (116) 1:3,5,6,7,13,20,25 2:6.11.25 3:3.10.22 4:16 5:25 6:5.18 7:5.19 8:6.12.14.21 9:10.14.17.18.20 10:3,5,9,13,14,16,22,24 11:3.10 12:9.18.22 13:9,19,20,22,24,25 14:7,12,20 15:6.10.13.15.18.18 16:1 18:7.20 19:3.12.23 20:11 21:2.10 23:5 25:13.18 28:9.20.21 29:24 30:1 31:13 32:3,19,25,25 33:1,2,9,12 34:9,17,25 35:5 39:9,13 41:4,19,24 42:5,7,16 43:10,14,15 44:1.9 45:2.9 46:16.24 47:9.25 48:11.13 49:7.12 50:3.9.15.17.23.25.52:1 much (6) 16:13 37:2,5 38:13 44:13 46:22

must (5) 6:11 13:1 14:10 18:4 29:9 myself (2) 16:9 19:19

narrative (1) 14:16 nature (3) 6:11 19:2 30:23 necessarily (2) 14:21 19:17 necessary (3) 31:19 32:11 49:22 need (32) 3:11.12.16 4:6 6:14.18.20 11:23 13:12 17:19,21,25 18:1,2,13,20 19:7,9 21:11 23:7 25:17 29:12 33:5 35:19 36:3 41:19 43:9 44:25,25 45:5 46:5 49:8 needed (4) 6:13 12:2 31:6 42:17 needing (1) 43:12 needs (4) 2:16 6:1 20:20 21:7 nerve (1) 53:9 nervous (1) 22:16 nervousness (1) 24:8 never (1) 40:5 newcomers (1) 50:8 newspaper (1) 3:5 next (4) 10:4 19:7 35:12 47:7 nicklin (119) 1:3,12,17,23 2:10,21 3:1,4,11 4:15,19 6:4.17.20 7:11.20 8:11.13.16.22 9:15 10:1,8,11,15,20,23 11:2,9 12:4.7.10.21 13:23 14:1.8 16:5.17.25 17:3 18:11.17 19:6,14,22 20:12,17,25 21:5 22:10,14,24 23:5,18 25:9,16,20 26:6,19 27:20 28:8.17.19 29:4.17.24 31:12 32:4.22 33:4.11.19 35:3,13,15 36:3,15,19 37:18.22 38:9.13 39:19 40:17 41:13.18 42:16.23 43:1,8,11,15 44:19 45:8 46:7,17,25 47:10 48:1,12 49:6,8,13 50:4,10,16,18,24 51:5,11,13,24 53:1,6,8,13,21 54:4,9

Opus 2 Official Court Reporters

43:23

focused (1) 50:4

follow (1) 13:16

night (3) 16:13,23 25:7

nobody (2) 23:16 51:8

noncompliance (2) 9:9 19:4

nothing (3) 5:11 18:19 40:3

notice (3) 18:23,25 39:19

notification (2) 1:20 4:8

notwithstanding (1) 29:8

none (3) 24:15,16 39:19

nonsitting (2) 9:19,23

nights (1) 24:12

nondog (1) 35:23

normal (1) 24:22

noted (1) 2:12

notes (1) 52:17

number (6) 1:11 3:23 5:25 38:25 44:6.15 numbered (2) 11:13,20 numbers (9) 14:17.18.19 18:15 19:11 25:10 45:22 53:7 54:7 nutshell (1) 27:20

object (3) 13:9 19:8 41:4 objecting (1) 28:20 objection (3) 6:8 42:8,12 objections (3) 3:18 14:22 18:11 obligations (1) 17:22 obliged (2) 7:8 30:11 obstruct (1) 27:16 obstructed (3) 28:3 39:6.6 obstructing (2) 38:19 47:23 obstruction (2) 36:17 44:24 obtaining (1) 6:10 obviously (9) 1:9 2:11,14 3:11 8:9 20:10 30:18 46:1,4 occasion (1) 43:17 occasions (3) 2:3 38:18 39:5 oclock (3) 37:12 38:4,5 offer (2) 30:25 31:1 office (1) 40:8 oh (3) 10:23 22:11 47:3 okay (22) 10:23 12:7 16:3,17 19:13 20:22 21:4 22:14 28:16.24 29:16 35:3.13 37:8 38:9 40:17 41:9 43:8.11 45:8 49:6.20 onesided (1) 34:14 open (2) 9:12 34:11 opening (6) 6:21 8:15,16 9:22 11:4 15:18 operate (1) 24:5 operates (2) 12:24 31:21 opine (1) 33:6 opinions (4) 27:1.8 28:12.14 opportunity (4) 17:13 25:10 32:4 52:19 opposition (2) 19:2 35:17 option (1) 32:9 oral (2) 3:24 7:10 order (24) 6:24 11:21 12:5 13:13.22 14:7.9.10 19:4 20:19 23:10 32:20 44:20 47:4.13.14 48:9.15 49:22,25 50:6,13 52:6,11 ordered (1) 30:20 orders (6) 8:20 9:9 13:2,10 18:18 21:24 ordinarily (3) 9:1 12:25 18:24 ordinary (2) 17:5,5 organising (1) 13:25 original (1) 22:25 originally (2) 2:13 9:19 others (2) 31:10 52:14 otherwise (6) 4:8 12:1 30:13 41-12 47-22 50-14 ought (4) 32:10 36:7,8,11 outcome (2) 8:8 11:10 outline (1) 21:18 outside (2) 37:21 51:24 over (3) 19:7 33:16 37:1 overall (1) 9:5 overnight (1) 40:15 overspeaking (5) 16:18 20:25 28:5 43:3 53:18 overwhelmed (1) 17:25 overwhelming (1) 22:3 own (4) 5:6 17:4 20:19 29:19

paragraph (9) 14.7 8 17 18 19 18:14 19:11 25:10 54:6 paragraphs (4) 11:20 41:21 44:2 53:7 parameters (2) 3:16 36:4 park (1) 47:2

pattern (1) 16:10 pause (1) 9:17 pending (1) 48:3 people (8) 23:14 27:8 32:2 37:20 39:21 43:24 50:10 52-12 peoples (4) 27:14 30:5 34:18 38:1 perfect (2) 10:1 19:17 perfectly (9) 8:18 9:3 12:10 19:22,24 40:4 46:17 49:18 51:1 perhaps (1) 46:15 period (1) 52:20 periphery (1) 33:25 permission (4) 11:23 28:8,21 29:7 permit (2) 7:6 52:4 permitted (3) 26:2 33:16 36:5 person (13) 1:7 2:18 8:2 21:23 23:14 32:12 44:4 49:15.20 50:6 51:3.4 52:4 persons (22) 4:24 17:10 22:20 23:3,7,11,24 43:13.19.22 44:7.15 45:9 46:1,18,21,25 47:1 51:6 52:3,11,22 perspective (1) 44:13 persuade (5) 28:9 36:10 39:2 42:25 43:1 persuaded (3) 32:10.14.16 persuading (1) 33:5 peterborough (1) 1:13 phase (1) 52:9 physical (1) 12:3 pick (1) 30:1 picture (1) 7:22 pinching (1) 19:19 place (9) 24:22.22 27:24 35:8 36:1,23 39:8 44:3 48:25 play (1) 23:2 please (3) 12:6 13:8,12 pointed (1) 14:12 points (13) 5:25 10:13 17:18 24:3 25:3,16,24 30:9 42:4 50:19.22 52:17.21 police (1) 47:24 political (1) 30:15 position (19) 5:11 6:21 9:5,6 15:25 19:24 21:2.5.21.22 23.6 19 25.12 31.3 34.22 35:1 42:9 53:23,24 positive (1) 4:3 possible (3) 17:7,8 47:20 possibly (2) 13:5 16:10 potato (1) 35:8 potential (1) 10:16 potentially (1) 21:14 power (1) 47:17 practitioner (1) 26:9 pragmatic (3) 5:3 6:22 48:2 pratt (2) 1:6 9:18 preference (1) 10:11 prejudge (1) 49:17 prejudice (5) 7:14 9:8 12:16 14:24 21:14 preliminary (1) 32:14 premises (2) 31:7 34:24

prepared (2) 9:3 30:19

preparing (2) 29:21 54:2

present (6) 1:9 4:1 15:2 24:6

part (7) 5:15 9:14 13:19 23:2

36:9 39:12 47:13

particular (3) 12:16 13:12

particulars (2) 38:21 45:24

participate (1) 2:1

particularly (1) 52:3

parties (2) 8:3 23:12

parts (2) 3:18 27:13

passionate (1) 35:9

nast (4) 24:20 39:10.15

partly (1) 31:24

21:13

49:21

34:23 46:10 presenting (1) 17:14 presents (1) 17:4 pressick (1) 32:25 pressicks (3) 40:1 43:15 44:1 pretrial (3) 11:21 12:5 13:3 prevent (3) 6:25 7:1 44:12 previously (1) 52:15 primarily (1) 32:20 primary (1) 6:21 prior (1) 15:3 probabilities (1) 39:2 probably (6) 2:19 11:8 19:23 34:21 49:10 51:16 problem (1) 47:19 problems (1) 3:20 procedure (1) 13:17 proceed (2) 10:17 33:17 proceedings (9) 4:5 5:10 14:14 23:13 33:14 35:16 52:8,13,15 process (2) 23:25 39:12 produced (1) 39:3 productive (1) 7:23 profit (1) 26:8 profitable (1) 3:13 progress (1) 30:21 prohibiting (2) 48:23 49:14 property (3) 27:16 28:3,3 proportionate (1) 49:22 proposal (1) 15:7 proposed (1) 15:7 proposing (2) 15:13 44:14 prosecuted (1) 14:5 protest (10) 26:20,21 27:5.11.13.22 34:7 36:25 37:4 38:17 protested (1) 37:1 protesters (4) 27:22 37:23,24 38:14 protests (1) 26:22 prove (8) 26:23 28:12,13 35:19 37:22,24 38:2 39:1 provide (1) 42:18 provided (8) 2:1.4 12:15,23,24 15:21 34:21 48:8 providing (3) 13:3,4,6 provisions (1) 23:8 pspo (1) 47:15 ptr (3) 6:6 13:22 14:7 pu1 (1) 44:5 pu2 (1) 44:5 pu3 (1) 44:5 pu4 (1) 44:5 public (4) 38:11,14 52:5,14 puppies (1) 37:15 puppy (1) 37:14 purely (2) 11:15 34:12 purpose (5) 9:2 36:12,20 46:9 48:21 puts (3) 14:24 23:25 24:4 putting (1) 5:17 Q

30:23 31:9 36:13 41:1,3 quite (5) 3:22 4:4,11 18:20 38:15 rabbit (2) 25:1,1 rabbits (1) 24:24 raise (4) 9:11 25:17 41:18 52:17 raised (1) 15:1 raises (1) 3:23 raising (3) 24:3 25:23 42:4

random (1) 52:5

round (1) 4:22

ruling (1) 31:15

routine (1) 32:23

rules (4) 8:1.2 9:9 13:18

quarter (1) 16:22

51:25 52:6

question (15) 7:3 18:5 22:19

38:3,7 40:12 41:6,8 47:12

29:5 34:2 36:6 37:19

questions (8) 4:2 6:14 7:1

rather (5) 4:16 15:17 24:9 51-18 52-23 reach (1) 27:1 read (4) 5:3 20:24 21:11 51:10 reading (1) 15:22 ready (2) 9:12 24:12 real (4) 7:14 9:7 46:12 48:21 realised (1) 16:23 reality (1) 23:15 really (7) 7:20 8:3 21:5,22 24:13 36:19 38:15 reason (8) 1:19 3:7 20:6 29:10 32:16 35:9 37:20 48:13 reasonable (2) 8:18 14:13 reasons (3) 19:25 23:24 44-10 received (2) 2:22 3:8 recitation (1) 43:20 recognise (3) 7:25 8:1 52:14 recognised (1) 7:24 reconvene (1) 53:3 references (1) 53:25 referred (1) 3:6 referring (3) 2:22 11:4 12:1 refinement (1) 48:24 reflect (2) 13:7 36:11 reflected (1) 12:14 regard (4) 27:22 34:10 49:11 52:21 regarding (1) 33:1 regular (1) 43:16 regulated (1) 40:4 rejigging (1) 9:21 relating (1) 15:3 relation (1) 18:17 relevance (5) 5:19,23 28:23 37:18 40:24 relevant (26) 4:11 26:10 29:4 30:9 31:9,20 33:11,12,13,14,23 34:1.3.24 36:24 37:7 38:9.22 40:18.21 41:2.6.21 45:16 46:2.22 relied (1) 24:20 relief (4) 7:8,10 18:21 29:6 reluctant (1) 34:13 rely (4) 29:7,19 33:2 53:18 remarkable (1) 40:16 remarkably (1) 22:3 remedied (1) 15:1 remedy (3) 23:23 46:23 47:7 remote (1) 31:19 represented (2) 8:3 13:1 request (1) 14:13 requested (1) 1:25 require (7) 12:18 26:22 27:4 37:3.23.24 51:7 required (7) 17:13 19:25 20:3 26:25 27:10 32:10 37:3 requirement (1) 18:22 requires (2) 18:3 27:5 requiring (2) 32:5,18 research (1) 33:6 resend (1) 14:19 reservation (1) 31:23 resisting (1) 17:14 respect (2) 26:20 33:9 response (3) 2:2 5:3 9:8 responsible (1) 20:19 restrained (1) 39:10 review (2) 11:21 13:4 reviewed (1) 3:17 ridiculous (1) 16:21 rights (2) 27:22 47:16 rigorous (1) 27:2 ring (1) 48:3 rise (3) 12:15 14:24 36:25 role (2) 17:16 22:25 rolled (1) 29:3

run (1) 42:17 running (1) 4:17 same (1) 20:2 sampling (1) 46:20 sanction (2) 18:21 29:6 sanctions (1) 7:9 satisfied (2) 49:21.24 saturday (1) 38:4 saw (1) 13:3 saying (5) 25:20 31:14 36:22 48:19 49:20 scale (2) 44:6 45:1 scandalous (1) 51:12 schedule (1) 45:25 scheduled (1) 3:15 schedules (2) 45:6.7 scientific (1) 27:2 scope (1) 34:8 search (1) 27:3 second (3) 5:19 39:12 52:9 secondly (4) 6:5,19 10:16 48:25 seconds (1) 29:1 section (1) 45:23 security (6) 37:9,10,13,17 38:6 40:13 see (9) 1:14 3:20 14:1 24:16 28:23 37:18 38:6 40:10 46:9 seeing (1) 40:24 seek (1) 28:13 seeking (2) 33:2 48:9 seem (1) 4:16 seems (6) 2:6,19 7:2 8:14 10:2 11:5 seen (2) 41:12 45:23 send (2) 19:11 54:6 sense (5) 7:15 10:1 25:13 35:7 46:17 sensible (4) 12:10 15:7 41:18 49:18 sent (4) 2:17 11:7 15:4 25:14 sentence (3) 10:17,22,23 sentenced (1) 1:18 sentencing (1) 1:8 separate (5) 5:2 29:13 51:19 53:11.16 serendinitous (1) 9:2 series (2) 38:16 43:21 serious (5) 11:1 21:17,17 24:10 37:25 serve (3) 11:22 21:16 48:21 served (2) 23:9,12 service (4) 23:8,10 47:4,5 set (3) 14:16 17:25 38:21 sets (1) 44:2 sharing (1) 9:15 shell (2) 2:4 28:10 shes (23) 2:2,3 10:6,9,9 11:6 13:9 14:22,22 15:6,12,22 19:24 25 20:1 21:2 21 24:18.18.19 39:13 42:5.8 shielded (1) 17:8 short (1) 52:20 should (15) 4:11 6:9 9:8,21,23 11:25 15:25 30:22 31:22 32:17 39:10,15 49:1 52:18,21 shouldnt (1) 23:23 shouted (1) 35:25 show (2) 27:10 47:3 shutting (3) 52:12,16,19 side (6) 18:3 23:21,22 24:6

27:12,25

since (1) 43:18

sister (1) 28:25

sincerely (1) 36:25

sincerity (1) 35:17

single (2) 43:6 44:16

sit (7) 15:10,14,14 22:17

28:24 41:20 54:10

similar (3) 3:8 13:21 16:10

28:4 38:15 42:12,25

simple (9) 22:1,3 23:1 25:2,3

tails (1) 22:9

44:3 45:20

30.25 36.23

talk (2) 22:16 33:7

talked (1) 24:24

taken (5) 6:11 30:3 35:1

takes (5) 5:10 13:9 29:9

taking (3) 27:24 39:3 49:5

site (3) 37:13.16 38:6 sitting (1) 8:25 situation (1) 40:3 slapped (1) 16:19 small (2) 18:15 21:7 solicitors (1) 19:12 somebody (5) 1:17 17:17 26:22,22 31:20 someone (2) 24:19 51:3 something (7) 6:8 12:1 18:4 35:5 47:20 49:14.24 sometimes (2) 35:10 45:19 somewhere (1) 20:4 soon (1) 4:5 sort (8) 6:24 16:13,13,20 22:6,7 35:7 40:12 soul (2) 16:13 24:12 sounds (1) 24:13 source (1) 36:24 speech (1) 15:19 spend (3) 3:12 15:22 26:6 stage (1) 41:24 stand (2) 4:9 34:23 standard (1) 51:14 standby (1) 32:9 standing (1) 22:8 stands (1) 50:7 start (5) 19:20 20:4.5.6.7 started (1) 22:13 stated (1) 14:10 statement (36) 2:14,15,24 4:13 5:8.16.17 6:1.2 11:13,18 13:3,13,14,15 14:4,11,20 18:6,14 19:10 24:19 25:3 28:6 29:8 13 39:25 41:10.20 42:14 44:1 51:10 53:5,13,17 54:5 statements (6) 4:2 14:2 24:20 30:15 35:22 43:16 stay (1) 16:22 step (1) 27:9 sticks (1) 22:5 still (3) 18:11 30:24 32:25 stop (2) 26:13 27:8 straightaway (1) 25:18 strain (2) 23:25 24:4 strictly (1) 41:1 strike (2) 41:10 48:2 struggle (2) 26:2 28:22 struggled (2) 11:6 29:21 struggling (1) 30:22 stumbled (1) 43:4 subject (2) 36:16 39:16 substance (1) 11:15 substitute (1) 20:17 suggest (1) 17:19 suggested (1) 6:17 suggesting (1) 34:10 suggestion (2) 10:2 12:11 summary (8) 5:15 8:7 44:11 46:8.9.12 47:1.6 suppose (1) 37:12 sure (9) 1:19 9:17 20:8 24:2 30:8 46:7 47:12 48:4 50:18 surgeon (1) 24:18 surprise (2) 5:9 47:11 surprised (2) 5:11,12 susan (1) 40:1 suspect (1) 5:24 sympathetic (1) 31:17 system (2) 23:21 24:5 tabled (1) 45:21 tables (1) 20:3 tag (1) 22:9

tasks (1) 17:25 team (10) 3:14 6:14,15 7:17 12:14 14:20 18:8 19:3 21:7 25:18 technical (1) 11:14 technicalities (1) 4:21 telling (2) 25:4 52:20 tells (1) 2:14 ten (2) 16:9 29:1 term (1) 29:6 terms (2) 47:21 52:3 terrible (1) 24:13 test (2) 33:19 48:24 tested (2) 33:17,18 testing (2) 34:5,15 tests (1) 48:21 text (3) 13:22,24 14:16 thank (4) 29:23 52:25 53:2 54.9 thats (56) 1:21 2:7.19 4:4 5:23 6:17 7:22 8:5 9:2,14 14:21 15:17 16:21 17:21 19:18 20:17 22:2.12.12 25:8 26:8,14 29:6 30:15 32:1,9 33:10,15,23 34:15,25 36:12 37:2,7,23 38:7 39:3.24 40:12.16.18 46-5 7 25 47-18 49:6,10,14,19,24 50:16 51:5,12,25 52:23,23 theory (1) 23:13 therefore (2) 23:12 40:25 theres (20) 1:19 3:1,7 5:19 10:1 18:19 24:15,16 25:1 31-9 37-20 40-3 15 45:19.19 46:12 49:17 50:1 51:8,8 theyre (13) 7:6 13:1 25:24 28:16 29:2,2 31:8,8 32:8 35:24 36:2,5 38:21 theyve (2) 50:11 51:15 thing (8) 14:12 17:24 20:2 31:3 34:23 38:10 49:11 53:25 thinking (1) 40:12 third (1) 44:1 though (1) 9:13 thought (4) 15:11 29:17 46:4 47:2 threatens (1) 13:11 three (1) 13:12 threepage (2) 2:24 5:4 through (11) 18:22 22:2.4 23:8 30:12 39:13 41:20 45:6,11,17 48:3 throughout (1) 5:13 til (2) 16:22,22 time (24) 3:8,11,13 6:11,13,18 7:17 8:24 9:1 12:19 15:22 17:25 21:8.17 26:6.7 30:14 34:6 37:15 41:18 42:1 43:5 45:21 49:8 times (2) 39:8 45:10 timetable (4) 9:22 12:19 32:12 42:2 timing (1) 16:4 today (29) 1:13 2:7,9,12,20 3:13.17 6:25 8:14 11:24 15:13.14.16 16:1.18 18:6 19:8,15,24 20:14,23 21:1,3,22 29:11,25 40:19 43:9 54:1 told (1) 29:11 tomorrow (4) 1:14,15 15:13.14 too (2) 25:23 53:11 took (2) 39:8 48:25 topic (1) 5:2

transcripts (1) 9:15 treats (1) 26:17 trespass (2) 27:14 44:24 talking (4) 32:19,22 35:24 trespassed (3) 28:4 38:20 transcripts@opus2.com 020 4518 8448

transcript (3) 15:21,22 20:8

totally (1) 35:23

trained (1) 32:2

traits (1) 16:7

39:7 trial (29) 3:16 4:17,21 6:5,22 8:5 13:11 15:8 17:11 18:23 19:20 20:14 22:20 26:14 30:5.12.16 39:3.12.17 41:15,16,25 46:11 48:3 50:22 51:1,2 52:20 trials (1) 33:17 tribunal (1) 7:20 trickiest (1) 47:10 tricky (1) 47:6 tried (2) 17:6 22:1 triggered (1) 16:12 trolling (1) 16:15 troubles (1) 49:11 true (1) 14:4 trust (1) 51:13 truth (10) 6:2 11:13 13:14,15 14:20 18:14 19:10 53:5.13 54:5 try (3) 17:11,11 36:10 trying (2) 49:16 50:5 tuesday (2) 9:19 15:12 turn (1) 23:14 turned (1) 20:3 type (3) 37:17 38:7 46:12

ultimately (7) 7:23 11:17 18:25 20:18 26:7 44:22 uncertainty (1) 10:3 undercover (1) 3:6 underpins (1) 26:21 understand (19) 2:8,10,22 3:7 7:11 10:22 17:12 18:2 19:6 20:20 35:21 36:4,7,18 38:10,12 40:5 46:17 49:7 understandable (2) 19:22,25 understanding (3) 16:20 36:1 48:14 understood (1) 11:2 unexpected (1) 25:21 unfairness (1) 26:3 unfortunate (1) 9:24 unfortunately (2) 30:21 40:6 unknown (27) 4:24 17:10 22:21 23:3,7,11,14,25 43:13,19,22 44:4,7,15 45:10 46:1,18,21 47:1,2 49:15 51:3.4.6 52:4.12.23 unless (3) 3:7 6:23 20:6 unlike (1) 47:14 unlikely (2) 26:8 51:5 unreasonable (1) 53:22 unrepresented (1) 13:1 unsatisfactory (1) 15:17 until (5) 1:7 3:15 8:8 9:24 54:12 untrue (1) 14:6 unusual (1) 23:19 unwise (1) 34:21 updated (2) 25:10 43:17 uphill (1) 26:2 upon (11) 7:13 9:6 13:7 28:4 29:7,19 33:2 34:16 38:23 46:11 49:21 used (3) 2:2 24:5 26:16

van (1) 47:24 variety (1) 50:18 various (4) 3:4 18:23 43:15,20 vehicles (2) 38:19 39:6 verbal (1) 53:19 versions (1) 45:3 vet (2) 40:15 42:19 veterinary (2) 24:18 26:9 victims (1) 49:19 video (2) 44:18 51:21 videolink (4) 31:6,11 32:15,23

using (1) 19:16

usually (3) 23:20 48:16,17

olinks (1) 31:14 videos (3) 45:15,21 46:2 vivisection (1) 26:14

waive (1) 18:22 waived (1) 8:17 walk (1) 47:2 wants (4) 8:4 21:13 33:5 50:25 warning (1) 43:11 watch (1) 44:17 way (11) 8:17 11:5 12:20 16:11 17:12 25:17 46:5 48:3,17 49:2 50:1 weak (1) 26:24 weakened (1) 26:25 wednesday (14) 1:8 9:19 10:7,8,12 15:12,15 16:1 19:9,16 20:1 53:3 54:10,13 week (7) 4:19,20 6:9 8:25 10:6 15:10 21:15 weekend (1) 35:11 weeks (1) 46:15 welcome (2) 50:20 51:1 welfare (1) 24:23 wendy (6) 28:6,6,18 39:25 40:1 41:10 werent (1) 15:3 weve (12) 2:2,17 4:10 8:24 24:20 30:21 45:2,4,14,15,16 47:19 whatever (2) 11:10 32:16 whats (13) 2:23 3:1 6:16 13:14 14:23 15:25 18:2 20:21 22:3 25:6 27:24 39:20 51:24 whereabouts (1) 13:24

whilst (4) 12:2 31:3 49:17 52:4

white (1) 25:1 whole (1) 23:13 wider (1) 36:22 withdrawn (2) 8:18 31:1 witness (23) 2:14,15 3:24 4:2,9,13 5:8,16 6:1 13:13 14:2,11 18:6 24:17 25:3 28:7 29:7,13 32:18 43:16 44:1 51:4 53:17 witnesses (19) 1:21 4:1,6,18

30:7.10.24 31:4 32:6.19 36:13 41:1 42:3 51:7 52:7 wondering (1) 9:21 wont (6) 21:10 27:13 30:9 35:19 40:9 47:11 wording (1) 14:3 work (4) 24:12 36:6 43:12 53:21 worker (1) 37:13 workers (5) 35:14,20,21

5:1 7:1 17:21 22:22

37:12 38:5 working (3) 16:22 36:2,8 workplace (2) 27:18 36:16 works (1) 26:19 world (1) 40:8 worse (1) 25:12 worth (1) 44:3 wouldnt (6) 14:15 20:4,5 30:11 34:9 52:4 wrists (1) 16:19 write (4) 29:13 53:24,24 54:5 written (2) 43:5 45:5

wrong (4) 27:23 28:14 39:15

wrongdoing (1) 44:22

wrongheaded (1) 27:8

40:3

years (3) 16:9,10 37:1 yet (3) 6:16 45:3 50:12 39:19 45:22,25 51:1 oure (26) 2:22 3:11 6:23

27:6.10.10 28:20 32:22 37:22 42:7 43:1 46:10 48:9 51:1 53:23 vourself (1) 17:25 youve (31) 8:23 12:12,22,23,24 14:9,14,16 15:4 16:7,25 18:8 21:6,8,12 25:4,14,16 29:11,14,20 33:4 39:9,14 41:4 42:2 46:10 49:19

21:5,22 25:9,22,25 26:13

48:4,12 49:18 zones (1) 48:14

1 (1) 55:4 **10 (3)** 14:7,8 26:21 **100 (1)** 12:12 11 (1) 38:5 1100 (2) 35:11 40:7 1154 (1) 54:11

20 (2) 16:10 40:14 2014 (1) 5:21 2023 (2) 1:1 54:13 22 (1) 13:20 **24 (2)** 1:1 15:5 **245 (3)** 4:10 6:10,12

**300 (3)** 16:23 45:20,20 **39 (1)** 44:2

**4 (2)** 37:12 38:4

**66 (1)** 44:2 6foot (2) 25:1,1

**700 (2)** 35:11 40:7

51:19 53:25 54:1 zone (7) 47:12,13,18,21

**1030 (3)** 1:2 54:10,13

**26 (1)** 54:13

youll (8) 9:5 10:20 14:1 26:1 7:2,21,21 8:25 13:11

> transcripts@opus2.com 020 4518 8448